
CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION
MAY 14, 2015- 4:00 PM

Minutes
City Hall
Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Harris Cohn, LaToya Grate, Ashby Gressette, Bowen Horger, John Powell, Robert Wynn

Members Not Yet Seated: Paul Bouknight, Ryan Hyler, Tom Savory

Staff: Amy Moore, Lucinda Statler, Staci Richey, Jerre Threatt, Stephen Zigmund, John Fellows

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Robert Wynn at 4:02 PM, Roll Call – Quorum established; points of order.

Amy Moore, Preservation Planner, noted changes to the Agenda since publication. She proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. CONSENT AGENDA
URBAN

HISTORIC

1. **2210 Wallace Street** (TMS#09016-05-02) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for Exterior Change and Preliminary Certification for Bailey Bill. *Cottontown Architectural Conservation District*
2. **1501 Lady Street** (TMS# 11402-12-14) Request for recommendation for landmark status. *City Center Design/Development District*
3. **1227 Maple Street** (TMS#11414-20-02) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction of outbuilding. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*
4. **1707 Wayne Street** (TMS# 09010-11-13) Request for recommendation for landmark status. *City Center Design Development District/Pending Individual Landmark*

Motion by Ms. Grate to approve the four Consent Agenda as recommended by staff and incorporate staff recommendations for each item. Motion seconded by Mr. Gressette. Consent Agenda approved 6-0.

III. REGULAR AGENDA

URBAN

1. **817-825 Main Street** (TMS# 11304-07-05, 06) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction of student housing. **DEFERRED**

2. **817-825 Main Street** (TMS# 11304) (TMS# 11304-07-05, 06) Request for Certificate of Site Plan Approval for new construction of student housing. **DEFERRED**

HISTORIC

1. **1218 Daly Street** (TMS#13901-04-19) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior change. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District* **DEFERRED**
2. **1306 Woodrow Street** (TMS#11414-06-11) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior change. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

Staci Richey, preservation planner, presented on the request for exterior change of c.1930 single-family single-story wood frame Bungalow that is contributing to the Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District. Recently the owner replaced the original front door and is now requesting to retain the replacement door.

Staff Recommendations

Staff finds that the proposal does not meet Section 7-1 of the guidelines and recommends that a Certificate of Design Approval be denied. Staff further recommends that the original door be reinstalled.

Annie Caggiano, property owner, presented on the request and provided two letters of support from neighbors.

No one spoke in favor or opposition of the request. Testimony closed for Board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to accept the design as presented by the applicant and that the door would remain. Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn.

Chairperson Wynn asked that the motion be repeated connecting it to the relevant guidelines.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to accept the request based on Section 7-1 of the guidelines as reviewed by staff, but accept the design as presented by the applicant. Motion seconded by Mr. Cohn.

Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior change approved 4-2 with Mr. Wynn and Mr. Powell in opposition of approval.

3. **1628 Calhoun Street** (TMS# 11404-02-09) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for Demolition. *Landmark District*

Amy Moore, preservation planner, presented on the request for demolition of a two-story, c. 1899 wood-framed residential structure that is a contributing building to the Landmark District. This district has the highest level of protection among the City's fifteen historic districts and therefore projects in this area must meet stringent design review criteria.

Criteria for demolition which the Commission is charged to consider are and whether or not the building meets individual criterion:

- 1) *The historic or architectural significance of a building, structure or object – yes;*

- 2) *A determination of whether the subject property is capable of earning a reasonable economic return on its value without the demolition, with consideration being given to economic impact to the property owner of the subject property – yes;*
- 3) *The importance of the building, structure or object to the ambience of a district – very important;*
- 4) *Whether the building, structure or object is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the city or the region – yes;*
- 5) *Whether there are definite plans for reuse of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and what the effect of those plans on the character of the surrounding area would be – yes, negative affect*
- 6) *The existing structural condition, history of maintenance and use of the property, whether it endangers public safety and whether the city is requiring its demolition – insufficient evidence;*
- 7) *Whether the building or structure is able to be relocated, and whether a site for relocation is available – none provided; and*
- 1) *Whether the building or structure is under orders from the city to be demolished due to severe structural deficiencies, and this criterion shall have added significance in comparison to the criteria mentioned in subsections (1) through (7) of this subsection – no.*

Staff Recommendations

Staff finds that the building retains historic and architectural integrity, contributes to the ambience of the district, generally appears to be structurally sound in the original section, is not under orders from the City to be demolished, and that the proposed plans for a vacant lot would have a negative effect on the character of the surrounding area as per section 17-674(e) of the City Ordinance; therefore staff recommends the request for demolition be denied.

Victoria and John Dozier, homeowners, presented on their request for demolition.

Elizabeth Marks, president of the Robert Mills Historic District, spoke in favor of the request for demolition.

Jesse Burke, Burke Engineering, felt the house is structurally damaged, and spoke in support of the request for demolition.

No one else spoke in favor or opposition of the request. Testimony closed for Board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Powell to grant a Certificate of Design Approval to allow for demolition of 1628 Calhoun Street based on the understanding that the building is structurally unsound, the financial viability of reconstructing that structure beneath the historic fabric of the building would make it unsustainable from a financial standpoint; as well as the basis that the adjacent properties have already been demolished for Columbia Eye Clinic, therefore drastically changing the Calhoun Street façade in general well before this case presented to the D/DRC. Motion seconded by Mr. Gressette.

Request for Certificate of Design Approval for demolition approved 5-1, with Ms. Grate in opposition.

4. 1227 Maple Street (TMS#11414-20-02) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for new construction of outbuilding. *Melrose Heights, Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

Moved to Consent Agenda
Moved to Consent Agenda

5. **1707 Wayne Street** (TMS# 09010-11-13) Request for recommendation for landmark status. *City Center Design Development District/Pending Individual Landmark*
6. **2150 Harden Street, Parker Annex Building** (TMS# 11501-01-01) Request for recommendation for landmark status. *Pending Individual Landmark*

Mr. Horger recused himself from discussion and voting on this project.

Jerre Threatt, preservation planner, presented on the request for recommendation for landmark status for 2150 Harden Street, Parker Annex Building.

Staff Recommendations

Staff recommends for the application of the –Design Preservation overlay to designate the Parker Annex Building on the Bull Street Campus as a Group II Landmark, using the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Preservation as amended in Sec. 17-674 of the Columbia City Code as design guidelines.

Ms. Moore stated that a letter of agency was received from the development group; however, staff has requested that a formal letter stating they acknowledge the process and approve of it be received. Any motion made should be conditional upon receiving that letter.

Wes Lyles, architect for the project, presented on the planning process of the request.

No one spoke in favor or opposition of the request. Testimony closed for Board discussion.

Based on the recommendation of staff, motion by Mr. Gressette to approve the request for Group II landmark status for 2150 Harden Street based upon Section 17-674 of the Columbia City Code conditional upon receiving the formal letter. *Motion seconded by Mr. Powell*

Motion to recommend Group II landmark status approved 5-0.

7. **1319 Summerville** (TMS#09113-02-06) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior change. *Cottontown/Bellevue Architectural Conservation District*

Jerre Threatt, preservation planner, presented the request. The applicants requested approval to remove one historic window located close to the southwest side of the home, visible from the sidewalk, to accommodate a new interior stairway.

Staff Recommendations

Staff does not recommend granting a Certificate of Design Approval for this project. However, staff could approve leaving the window in place and covering up the window on the interior, should the homeowners find that a viable option.

Tripp Swygert and Angie Jones, applicants, presented their request.

No one spoke in favor or opposition of the request. Testimony closed for Board discussion.

Motion by Mr. Gressette to deny the request for Certificate of Design Approval based on Section 7 of the Cottontown/Bellevue Architectural Conservation District Guidelines, as

well as Section 17-698 of the Columbia Zoning Ordinance which addresses the Bailey Bill projects and those recommendations by staff. *Motion seconded by Ms. Grate.*

Request for denial of application approved 6-0.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

April Minutes

Motion by Ms. Grate to approve the April 9th, 2015 D/DRC Minutes. Motion seconded by Mr. Horger. Motion approved 6-0.

VI. ADJOURN

There being no further business, meeting adjourned at 5:29 PM

Chairperson

Date

Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department