



## D/DRC Case

2211 Bull Street

Cottontown/Bellevue Architectural Conservation District

TMS: 09016-08-29

---

---

**DESIGN/DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION  
DESIGN REVIEW DISTRICT  
REGULAR AGENDA  
EVALUATION SHEET  
Case #1**

---

---

**ADDRESS:** 2211 Bull Street

**APPLICANT:** Lambros Xethalis, Owner

**TAX MAP REFERENCE:** TMS#09016-05-05

**USE OF PROPERTY:** Commercial

**REVIEW DISTRICT:** Cottontown/Bellevue Architectural Conservation District

**NATURE OF REQUEST:** Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for exterior change.

**FINDINGS/COMMENTS:**

The one-story house located at 2211 Bull Street was built in ca. 1930 and is a contributing structure in the Cottontown/Bellevue Architectural Conservation District.

The applicant is in the process of restoring the interior of the property. On March 16, 2015, staff was notified that the historic wood 6/6, 8/8, and fixed 14 pane windows were being replaced with vinyl windows without staff approval or city permit. Staff contacted the owner of the property, who agreed to retain the historic windows being replaced, until the project came before DDRC. The applicant noted that several of the windows at the Bull street property had already been replaced with vinyl prior to acquiring the property. Staff does not know when those historic windows were taken out, but it likely occurred prior to the implementation of guidelines. The applicant also notes that many buildings on the block of Bull Street also have vinyl windows. Staff acknowledges the presence of vinyl windows within the block, but this work is not in keeping with the guidelines and was likely performed prior to the formation of the Cottontown/Bellevue Architectural Conservation District in 2010.

**PERTINENT SECTIONS FROM THE GUIDELINES**

**SECTION VII: Guidelines for Maintenance & Rehabilitation**

**A. GENERAL PRINCIPLES**

Rehabilitation is a practical approach to historic preservation. It is the process of repairing or altering a historic building while retaining its historic features. It represents a compromise between remodeling, which offers no sensitivity to the historic features of a building, and restoration, which is a more accurate but costly approach to repair, replacement, and maintenance.

Rehabilitation guidelines are limited to the review of exterior elements visible from the public right-of-way. The priority of the guidelines is to ensure the preservation of a building's character-defining features while accommodating an efficient contemporary use.

## 2. WINDOWS

### a. Principles

Windows are a significant character-defining feature of any structure. They are like a piece of good furniture. Original windows were constructed so that individual components could be repaired, instead of requiring an entire new unit if one piece breaks or rots. This often means that an existing, historic window can be repaired for far less cost than a replacement. See the resource section for instructions on window repair and upgrade.

Repair of a historic window is the best first step when confronted with a damaged or deteriorated unit. If after careful evaluation, window frames and sash are so deteriorated they need replacement, new windows may be installed.

Replacement windows must be selected with care. They should generally match the original sash, pane size, configuration, glazing, materials, muntin and mullion detailing, and profile. Small differences between replacement and historic windows can make big differences in appearance.

If 50% or more are deteriorated or missing, then wholesale replacement of windows is allowable. When choosing replacements, the qualities of the original windows should be used as criteria. Consider the following features of the original:

- trim detail;
- size, shape of frame, sash;
- location of meeting rail;
- reveal or set-back of window from wall plane;
- materials, reflective qualities of glass.
- muntin, mullion profiles, configuration.

The new windows need not be exact replicas of the originals. In the Cottontown/Bellevue Architectural Conservation District, it is appropriate to substitute a window configuration found during the home's period of significance for the original. For instance, many homes have four slender panes over a single pane.

### b. Guidelines

*i. When technically and economically feasible, repair of deteriorated or damaged windows shall be preferred over replacement.*

Staff was not able to assess the condition of each window, but the windows that were on site in March appeared to be in good condition.

*ii. If replacement of a small number of units is deemed necessary after evaluating the sill, frame, sash, paint and wood surface, hardware, weather-stripping, stops, trim, operability, and glazing, replace with units that match the original in detailing, size, reflective quality, and materials.*

The current vinyl windows do not reflect the detailing, muntin profile, muntin depth or materials of the historic wood windows.

*iii. If wholesale replacement is found to be necessary, either match the original unit or substitute a unit appropriate to the home's period of significance, maintaining the use of historic materials where possible.*

Replacement windows should either match the original or substitute new materials sympathetic to the original. At the time of publication of these Guidelines, wood and aluminum clad windows are the most appropriate replacement materials. The usage of other materials, including vinyl, will be reviewed and evaluated based upon their compatibility/ appropriateness with the historically accurate materials. All approved materials must be a good visual substitute to wood/ the historically accurate material. Every material reviewed shall be evaluated based on the detailing, size, reflective quality, and materials when compared to wood and the original unit. The items listed below will be used to determine the appropriateness of proposed windows and materials.

- trim detail;
- size, shape of frame, sash;
- location of meeting rail;
- reveal or set-back of window from wall plane;
- materials, reflective qualities of glass.
- muntin, mullion profiles, configuration.

The new vinyl windows do not match the historic window's muntin profile, as the new windows have dividers between the glass. The vinyl material is not sympathetic to the original wood windows. If the applicant had gained a city permit for the window work, staff would have advised that any window replacement should be wood or aluminum clad.

*iv. Improve the thermal performance of existing windows and doors through adding or replacing weather stripping and adding storm windows which are compatible with the character of the building and which do not damage window frames.*

Not Applicable

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Per section VII of the Cottontown/ Bellevue Design guidelines, staff **does not recommend granting a Certificate of Design Approval** for the window replacement and recommends reinstalling the historic wood windows that were removed. If any new windows are required, staff will review and approve based on the design guidelines for Cottontown/ Bellevue. All details deferred to staff.*



2211 Bull Street



Replacement and original window

