



# D/DRC Case

100 Huger Street

**Granby Architectural Conservation District**

TMS: 08816-13-08

---

---

**DESIGN/DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION**  
**DESIGN REVIEW DISTRICT**  
**CONSENT AGENDA**  
**EVALUATION SHEET**  
Case #7

---

---

**ADDRESS:** 100 Huger Street

**APPLICANT:** Peter and Lynda Hoffman, Owners

**TAX MAP REFERENCE:** TMS#08816-13-08

**USE OF PROPERTY:** Residential

**REVIEW DISTRICT:** Granby Architectural Conservation District

**NATURE OF REQUEST:** Request for a Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes and preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill.

**FINDINGS/COMMENTS:**

The Granby Mill Village Historic District was listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1993, and the neighborhood became a locally designated Architectural Conservation District in 2010. The building located at 100 Huger Street is a contributing structure in both districts. The owner intends to rehabilitate the home, after a fire largely gutted the structure. The building has asphalt siding applied over original wood siding.

The applicant is requesting preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill for a rehabilitation proposal that includes new wiring, plumbing and other systems, replacing damaged siding with cement fiberboard on the rear and right elevation, replacing windows that were damaged by the fire with wood windows matching the existing, and replacing non-historic porch supports. The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize the property shall not be permitted.

The applicant estimated that qualified rehabilitation expenses for this project will meet or exceed the 20% minimum investment threshold needed to make the project eligible for the Bailey Bill. Any work done prior to receiving preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill by the D/DRC will not be included in the cost estimate used to determine eligibility.

**PERTINENT SECTIONS FROM GUIDELINES**

*The goal of this district and of these guidelines is to maintain and protect the structures that exemplify important parts of Columbia's history as well as to preserve, conserve, and enhance the character, function, and environment of the district. This task, particularly in the Granby Mill Village, must be accomplished with an appreciation of the development of the district and the history that is critical to its character. Where original materials are still intact and viable, they should be kept, repaired, and maintained.*

## **Section VII: Maintenance & Rehabilitation**

*Rehabilitation is a practical approach to historic preservation. It is the process of repairing or altering a historic building while retaining its historic features. It represents a compromise between remodeling, which offers no sensitivity to the historic features of a building, and restoration, which is a more accurate but costly approach to repair, replacement, and maintenance. Rehabilitation guidelines are limited to the review of exterior elements visible from the public right-of-way. The priority of the guidelines is to ensure the preservation of a building's character-defining features while accommodating an efficient contemporary use.*

### **DOORS**

#### **Principles**

*Significant features such as doors and entrances should be preserved wherever possible. Changes to door size and configuration should be avoided. Replacement doors should either match the original or substitute new materials and designs sympathetic to the original.*

*Sometimes new entrances are required for practical reasons or to satisfy code requirements. Placement of new entrances on principal facades should be avoided. New entrances can result in loss of historic fabric and detailing and change the rhythm of bays. New entrances should be compatible with the building and be located on side or rear walls that are not readily visible from the public right-of-way. If a historic entrance cannot be incorporated into a contemporary use for the building, the opening and any significant detailing should, nevertheless, be retained.*

#### **GUIDELINES**

1. *Install new openings so that they carry on the same rhythm of existing openings and are compatible in size, materials and design.*

Not Applicable

2. *Retain and repair historic door openings, doors, screen doors, trim, and details such as transom, sidelights, pediments, and hoods, where they contribute to the architectural character of the building.*

The front left door appears to be part of the Craftsman alterations to the house from c.1930s and will be kept if staff finds the door repairable.

3. *Replace missing or deteriorated doors with doors that closely match the original, or that are of compatible contemporary design. New materials will be judged based on their visual compatibility to historic materials, of which wood, or a combination of wood and glass, is most likely. Front doors may be solid paneled doors, or may have some combination of wood (or visually compatible material) and glass, with the recommendation being that doors not have more than half their composition in glass. Fiberglass or other visually compatible materials are permitted. The glass and two-panel door and the four-panel solid door shown at right are two examples of historically accurate door styles, although they are not the only door types permitted in the district.*

The front right door will be replaced with a wood door matching the left door.

4. *Place new entrances on secondary elevations away from the main elevation. Preserve non-functional entrances that are architecturally significant. To that end, two doors must be retained on the front facades of saltbox structures although both doors do not have to function as entries. The two doors should also match.*

Not applicable

5. *Add simple or compatibly designed wooden screen doors when necessary. Storm doors with full glass and minimal framing are preferred.*

Not applicable

6. *No new door openings shall be located on front façades of saltboxes unless it is to re-establish the common*

*rhythm of the two openings typical to these buildings. New openings, where permitted, should be compatible in size, materials and design to the saltboxes in the neighborhood.*

Not applicable

## **WINDOWS**

### **Principles**

*Windows are a significant character-defining feature of any structure. They are like a piece of good furniture. Original windows were constructed so that individual components could be repaired, instead of requiring an entire new unit if one piece breaks or rots. This often means that an existing, historic window can be repaired for far less cost than a replacement. Repair of a historic window is the best first step when confronted with a damaged or deteriorated unit. If after careful evaluation, window frames and sash are so deteriorated they need replacement, new windows may be installed. Replacement windows must be selected with care. They should generally match the original sash, pane size, configuration, glazing, materials, muntin and mullion detailing, and profile. Small differences between replacement and historic windows can make big differences in appearance.*

### **Guidelines**

*1. When technically and economically feasible, repair of deteriorated or damaged windows shall be preferred over replacement.*

A fire engulfed the structure making the windows not repairable. The applicant would like to replace all of the existing historic wood windows with wood windows matching the existing profile. An alternative would be a 6/6 pattern to better match the original windows as the existing 3/1 pattern was likely a c.1930s replacement. Muntin widths should be 5/8 inch to match historic profiles.

*2. If replacement of a small number of units is deemed necessary after evaluating the sill, frame, sash, paint and wood surface, hardware, weather-stripping, stops, trim, operability, and glazing, replace with units that match the original in detailing, size, reflective quality, and materials.*

Not applicable

*3. If wholesale replacement is found to be necessary, either match the original unit or substitute a unit appropriate to the home's period of significance, maintaining the use of historic materials where possible. Replacement windows should either match the original or substitute new materials sympathetic to the original.*

*At the time of publication of these Guidelines, wood and aluminum clad windows are the most appropriate replacement materials. The usage of other materials, including vinyl, will be reviewed and evaluated based upon their compatibility/appropriateness with the historically accurate materials. All approved materials must be a good visual substitute to wood/the historically accurate material. Every material reviewed shall be evaluated based on the detailing, size, reflective quality, and materials when compared to wood and the original unit.*

*The items listed below will be used to determine the appropriateness of proposed windows and materials:*

- *Trim detail*
- *Size, shape of frame and sash*
- *Location of meeting rail*

- *Reveal or set-back of window from wall plane*
- *Materials, reflective quality of glass*
- *Muntins, muntin profiles, pane configuration*

The new windows will be wood and match the existing in all detailing, or match what would have been original to the house, which is a 6/6 pattern.

## **EXTERIOR SIDING**

### **Principles: Wood**

*Granby houses were historically wood houses. Where original wood siding exists on a structure, it should be retained. If it becomes necessary to replace deteriorated boards, match the replacements to the characteristics of the original. Important characteristics of wood siding that should be considered in its repair or replacement are board size, width of exposure, length, and trim detail such as corner boards. Where the brittleness and/or profile and dimensions of the original siding makes repair a prohibitively costly and difficult endeavor, Hardiboard or a comparable material, of similar dimensions and reveals of the original siding, may be permitted.*

*One of the greatest threats to wood siding is the application of non-historic surface coverings such as aluminum and vinyl siding, stucco, and other synthetic materials. Application of nonhistoric exterior finishes results in either the removal or covering of historical materials and details. Decorative trim around doors, windows, and under rooflines is frequently removed. Detailing of the wood itself, such as beveling or beading, is also lost. Board width, length, and exposure are generally changed, thus altering the scale and appearance of the building. Artificial siding also frequently damages the fabric underneath. It can trap moisture and encourage decay and insect infestation.*

*In cases where artificial siding is already in place, its removal is not necessary under the guidelines. An owner may retain the material or remove it. If, however, the material is removed, it must be replaced with historically appropriate materials. In the case of original asbestos siding, if its removal is required, wood or cement fiberboard siding is an appropriate replacement. Vinyl is not a preferred material for siding in the district; however, in certain cases it might be permitted if it is shown that details typical of wood frame houses, such as inset windows, typical sized window sills, adequate reveal on siding, trim detailing, and so on, can be constructed. It will be the applicant's responsibility to provide required drawings and information which support their application for vinyl.*

### **Guidelines**

*1. Retain wooden features such as siding, cornices, brackets, soffits, fascia, window architrave, and doorway pediments.*

The home currently has asphalt siding over wood clapboards. Due to the fire, the applicant is proposing cement fiberboard siding on the rear and right side of the structure.

*2. Repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated material duplicating in size, shape, and texture the original as closely as possible. Consider original characteristics such as board width, length, exposure, and trim detailing when selecting a replacement material.*

Cement fiberboard is proposed to replace asphalt siding where fire/water damage is present.

*3. Artificial replacement siding over wood or brick is not permitted.*

Not applicable

4. *Where a structure has asbestos or masonite as original siding, it may be replaced with wood or composite wood products such as Hardiplank, or cement fiberboard.*

Cement fiberboard siding is proposed.

5. *Vinyl is not a preferred siding material.*

The applicant is not proposing vinyl siding.

## **PORCHES**

### **Principles**

*Porches serve as a covered entrance to buildings and a transitional space between the interior and exterior and are an important design feature on a house. They are often the principal location for ornamentation and detailing, such as brackets, posts and columns, and balustrades. Size, style, ornateness or simplicity, sense of openness, and detailing are all important attributes of porches. Such features should be preserved during the course of rehabilitating a building.*

*Because they are open to the elements, porches also require frequent maintenance and repair. Deteriorated porch features should be repaired rather than replaced. If replacement proves necessary, replacement features and materials should approximate the originals as closely as possible. If wholesale replacement is required, the new porch should be rebuilt based on historical research and physical evidence. If a porch or individual features of it are missing and no documentation or physical evidence is available, a new porch design that is compatible with the scale, design, and materials of the remainder of the building is appropriate. It is appropriate in the Granby district to replace missing or deteriorated features with compatible ones found on similar structures in the district. Where original materials of an existing element are substandard, it would be correct also to replace with more fitting materials found in the district, keeping in mind that simplicity of material and design are important qualities in the Granby Hill area.*

*Owners are often tempted to enclose porches for additional year round living space. Porch enclosures in Granby are strongly discouraged on bungalows. They will only be permitted after all other options have been examined and determined to not be attainable, and they must be done in an appropriate manner.*

*Transparent materials, such as clear glass enclosures or screens that are set behind balustrade and structural systems and maintain the visual openness of a porch are permitted. Porch enclosures are prohibited on saltbox and supervisory structures.*

### **Guidelines**

1. *Retain porches and steps that are appropriate to a building.*

The current porch supports are non-historic metal.

2. *If replacing deteriorated or missing features, it is appropriate to use other homes of the same style and period for the design of the new feature, as long as it is compatible with the structure.*

New supports and a balustrade will be installed out of wood and will be compatible with the structure.

3. *If enclosures are undertaken, maintain the openness of porches through the use of transparent materials such as glass or screens. Place enclosures behind significant detailing, so that the detailing is not obscured.*

The applicant is not proposing any type of porch enclosure.

## **Pertinent Review Criteria from the Bailey Bill Ordinance**

*(a) Standards for rehabilitation work. To be eligible for the special tax assessment, historic rehabilitations must be appropriate for the historic building and the historic district in which it is located. This is achieved through adherence to the following standards:*

*(1) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved; the removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize each property shall be avoided.*

Historic materials will be retained. Historic features will remain unchanged.

*(2) Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use; changes that create a false sense of historical development shall not be undertaken.*

Their goal is to rehabilitate this house to be more in keeping with the historic nature of the district.

*(4) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property should be preserved.*

All distinctive features and finishes that were not damaged beyond repair from the fire will be retained and preserved.

*(5) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced; where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new should match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials; replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

New windows and possibly a new door will match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Cement fiberboard is proposed for the siding on the rear and right elevation. As this siding is not replicating the original wood siding in materials it is not meeting this section of the ordinance. The historic material original to the building is wood siding, which may have a great deal left intact under the asphalt siding and along the walls of the house that were not affected by the fire. If asphalt siding is removed to reveal original siding and it is intact then it should be repaired rather than replaced, and if too deteriorated, replaced in kind in order to meet this ordinance.

*(6) Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used; the surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.*

The applicants are not proposing any sandblasting or other chemical or physical treatments.

*(7) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property; the new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the historic property and its environment.*

Not Applicable

*(8) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Not Applicable

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:**

*Staff finds that the proposal meets Section VII, Maintenance and Rehabilitation. Staff **recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval** for this project with the following recommendations:*

- *All details deferred to staff*

*Due to the proposed use of cement fiberboard siding, staff **cannot recommend that 100 Huger Street be given preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill**. If the applicant were to use wood siding, staff would recommend for approval conditional upon qualified rehabilitation expenses meeting or exceeding the 20% investment requirements.*

100 Huger Street – Granby Architectural Conservation District



100 Huger Street





100 Huger Street – Existing Conditions