



D/DRC Case

2336 Stark Street

Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A

TMS: 11409-04-08

DESIGN/DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION
DESIGN REVIEW DISTRICT
HISTORIC AGENDA
EVALUATION SHEET
Case #1

ADDRESS: 2336 Stark Street

APPLICANT: Kenneth Webb, property owner/contractor

TAX MAP REFERENCE: TMS#11409-04-08

USE OF PROPERTY: Residential

REVIEW DISTRICT: Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A

NATURE OF REQUEST: Request Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes

FINDINGS/COMMENTS:

This is a request to install vinyl siding and replace all of the windows on the ca. 1930 single-story wood-sided house located at 2336 Stark Street in the Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area. The design guidelines in this district allow these changes to be made, but the changes must be visually consistent with the property's historic appearance. For example, the guidelines state that replacement windows should be similar in design to the original windows and that new siding should preserve the form, size and details of the original siding. The windows currently installed in this property are not original, and the original window pane configuration is unknown. Staff normally recommends a pane configuration found on similar houses within the district, such as 6/6 with exterior muntins or 1/1 without muntins.

The applicant has already purchased 6/6 vinyl replacement windows with grilles between the glass (GBG). Staff has always discouraged the use of GBG windows in protection areas as they do not replicate the depth and dimension of historic wood windows. The Whaley Street Protection Area, however, is the only protection area with guidelines that specifically state that replacement windows must feature three-dimensional muntins. There are many examples of vinyl GBG windows in the Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area, and several contributing houses on Stark Street have GBG windows. The D/DRC has not approved the use of GBG windows in this district recently because most projects have specified 1/1 windows, but GBG windows have been approved by the Commission for use in other Protection Areas.

Protection Areas exist to protect the environs of districts which are distinctive in character or function. In general, Protection Areas are much more flexible than Architectural Conservation Districts in terms of architectural details and conservation of historic materials. The guidelines for Old Shandon/Lower Waverly state that they must be administered in a flexible manner so that the historic integrity and feel can be maintained with minimal technical restrictions. Staff finds that the applicant's proposal to use 6/6 vinyl GBG windows meets the

intent of the guidelines. The proposed installation of vinyl siding over the existing wood siding is also in keeping with the guidelines.

PERTINENT SECTIONS FROM GUIDELINES

C. EXTERIOR CHANGES

Principles

While the Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area includes a diverse array of building styles, there are common elements of a structure which, when changed, have the effect of either reinforcing or degrading the proper proportion and detailing of a structure. The intent in reviewing these elements in this district is not to require restoration to a historic period, but to assure that changes do not result in the loss of integrity of the structure or the district.

When possible, plan projects so that the least amount of change to the historic fabric of the structure is required. Design necessary changes so that they will not impact the significant character defining features of a building.

2. Guidelines for Change or Relocation of Openings (doors & windows)

- c. When replacing a window or door unit use a design similar to the original (ex. use a window with a 2/2 pane configuration if the original was a 2/2 configuration).*

The existing horizontal 2/2 wood windows are not original to the house, and the original window style and pane configuration is unknown. The applicant has already purchased vinyl 6/6 GBG windows, which is an appropriate pane configuration for this house.

4. Guidelines for Change in Siding Material

- a. Preserve the form, size and details of exterior siding.*
- b. Permitted materials include:
 - i. Horizontal wood, aluminum, vinyl, Hardi-plank™ or other synthetic material;*
 - ii. Brick*
 - iii. Stucco*
 - iv. Stone or decorative cast concrete block**
- c. Prohibited materials include:
 - i. T-1-11 or other vertical siding*
 - ii. Concrete block*
 - iii. Plywood or other similar surface.**

The applicant is proposing a smooth vinyl siding that preserves the form, size and details of the existing horizontal wood siding.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds that proposals meet the established design guidelines for the Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area and **recommends granting a Certificate of Design Approval** for the project as proposed with the following conditions:

- All details deferred to staff

2336 Stark Street – Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A



Existing conditions – façade



Left side



Right side

2336 Stark Street – Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A



2336 Stark Street and neighboring houses



Houses across the street from 2336 Stark Street

2336 Stark Street – Old Shandon/Lower Waverly Protection Area A



Houses on the 2300 block of Stark Street with vinyl GBG windows.

