
CITY OF COLUMBIA
DESIGN / DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMISSION
DECEMBER 12, 2013- 4:00 PM

Minutes
City Hall

Council Chambers • 1737 Main Street • Columbia, SC

Members Present: Bruce Harper, Doris Hildebrand, Catherine Horne, Betsy Kaemmerlen, Dale Marshall, Lesesne Monteith, David Ross, Beronica Whisnant

Member Absent: Dr. Leslie Skinner

Staff: Amy Moore and John Fellows

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson David Ross at 4:03 PM, Roll Call – Quorum established, swearing in of applicants and public speakers, points of order.

Amy Moore, Preservation Planner, noted changes to the Agenda since publication. She proceeded with review of the Consent Agenda.

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. CONSENT AGENDA

- 1. 1626 Main Street** (TMS#R09014-04-18) Request for preliminary approval for Bailey Bill. *Individual Landmark II.*

Staff recommends that 1626 Main Street be given preliminary certification approval for the Bailey Bill, conditional upon the 20% investment threshold being met.

- 2. Review of existing Bailey Bill projects**
- 1. 1338-50 Main Street**
 - 2. 701 Whaley Street**

Motion by Ms. Kaemmerlen to approve Consent Agenda items subject to staff recommendations; seconded by Ms. Hildebrand. Motion approved 7-0. (Ms. Kaemmerlen arrived after Consent Agenda.)

URBAN

HISTORIC

III. REGULAR AGENDA

URBAN

DEFERRED 1. **611 Park Street, 701 Park Street & E/S Lincoln Street** (TMS#08915-09-01, 08915-10-01 and 08914-18-01) Request for Certificate of Design Approval for site plan approval. *Innovista Design District, MX-2 –ID Zoning*

DEFERRED 2. **611 Park Street, 701 Park Street & E/S Lincoln Street** (TMS#08915-09-01, 08915-10-01 and 08914-18-01) Request for site plan approval for student housing. *Innovista Design District, MX-2 –ID Zoning*

3. **1022 Senate Street** (TMS#08916-09-14) Request for design review approval for a music event center. *City Center Design Development District, C-4 – DD Zoning.*

John Fellows, Planning Administrator, presented for the request to renovate an existing structure into the Tin Roof/Music Farm Event Center. Modifications to the structure will be minor on the majority of the building, and changes made will ensure cohesiveness of the building to the area. The site plan, parking lot and landscaping were discussed. The request is compliant with the Design Guidelines for the City Center.

Steve Akers with the Innovations Group, LLC said they will work with staff regarding landscaping and use of a larger shade tree.

Motion by Ms. Kaemmerlen to grant the request for Certificate of Design Approval for the renovation and modification at 1022 Senate Street for a music event center with the following conditions:

1. *A masonry wall shall be provided to screen the parking from the street when the buffer is less than five feet in width. The brick masonry wall to match the brick on the building shall be reviewed and approved by staff and have a min height of 36 inches measured from the parking lot surface.*
2. *A permanent encroachment will need to be applied for, approved for installation of a driveway(s) and any other modifications to the streetscape.*
3. *Replace the Crape Myrtle with a shade tree.*
4. *Additional landscaping in the center parking area.*
5. *All other details to be deferred to staff.*

Mr. Ross noted that the discrepancy of the address as noted in the packet of 1022 Senate Street and on the case summary as 1000 Senate Street has been corrected noted, and was correctly stated in the motion.

Motion seconded by Mr. Harper. Motion passes 8-0.

HISTORIC

- WITHDRAWN
1. **1132 Woodrow Street** (TMS#11414-19-01) Request Certificate of Design Approval for demolition. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*
 2. **2312 Gadsden Street** (TMS#09012-15-22) Request Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Elmwood Park Architectural Conservation District*

Jerre Threatt, city planner, spoke on four square wood columns on the home that were removed and replaced without review, permits, or issuance of a CDA. Applicant stated they were too deteriorated to repair, however staff was not able to assess condition prior to removal. Applicant would also like to install new railings and a new porch ceiling. Proposing use of turned balusters instead of square wood pickets. New features must meet building code, and is not within D/DRC jurisdiction. The proposed replacement meets the guidelines and staff recommends granting a CDA with conditions, as the project is in compliance with Sec. 17-674 (d) of the Zoning Ordinance.

Nathan and Rachael Elger, property owners, presented on their request.

Motion by Mr. Marshall to grant the request for Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes at 2312 Gadsden Street for:

- *four new wood columns on the front porch to match the dimensions, detailing (bases, tops, moldings, etc.) and finish of the originals*

- *A new wood beadboard porch ceiling that matches the original shall be installed*
- *A new wood porch railing system shall be installed with simple top and bottom rails and square wood pickets to visually match the original that was removed.*
- *If required by City building officials, a minimal handrail shall be installed with the design deferred to staff.*
- *All new wood features on the porch be of a painted finish; with the exception that the new handrail could be designed to be a painted metal finish if able to be constructed in a more simple manner as required, with all details deferred to staff.*
- *All other details deferred to staff*
- *Making this motion to bring the project into compliance with Sec. 17-674 (d) of the Zoning Ordinance.*

Motion seconded by Ms. Kaemmerlen. Motion passes 8-0.

3. 2203 Lincoln Street (TMS#09012-14-14) Request Certificate of Design Approval for exterior changes. *Elmwood Park Architectural Conservation District*

Jerre Threatt, city planner, spoke on the two-story wood sided house which is a contributing structure in the local Elmwood Park Architectural Conservation District as well as the National Register listed Elmwood Park Historic District. A significant amount of work was done to the front porch roof and upper balustrade without review, permits, or the issuance of a CDA. Materials were removed however staff was able to see materials before they were discarded. There was significant rot on some sections; however extensive replacement may not have been necessary. Staff was able to determine that the upper balustrade was not an original feature. Since over 50% of the upper balustrade was removed, the new portion of the balustrade will be required to meet current building codes.

Jonathan Hix, property owner, presented on his request which is more of a repair job.

Motion by Ms. Whisnant to approve the request for Certificate of Design Approval for 2203 Lincoln Street for exterior changes as the project is in compliance with Sec. 17-674 (d) of the Zoning Ordinance and with the following conditions:

- **A new upper balustrade shall be installed on the front and right sides to match the remaining section on the left side**
- **The balustrade shall be constructed of treated wood and feature a painted finish**
- **All details deferred to staff including any additional work required to meet code**

Motion seconded by Mr. Monteith. Motion passes 8-0.

4. 1213 Lady Street (TMS# R09013-06-08) Request for recommendation for landmark status. *Pending Individual Landmark*

Amy Moore, preservation planner, spoke on this mid-century building that meets many of the recommendations for Landmark II status. There will be some exterior changes proposed to the building which will need to be commented upon as part of the landmark designation if the applicant requests the Bailey Bill.

Scott Garvin, agent for the owner, spoke on the request.

Motion by Mr. Monteith to approve the request for recommendation for Group II Landmark designation as outlined in Section 17-691(c) in the City Ordinance and makes a recommendation for its designation.

Motion seconded by Mr. Harper. Motion for recommendation passes 8-0.

- 5. 931 Senate Street** Request (TMS# R08916-02-09) Certificate of Design Approval for unapproved exterior changes. *West Gervais Street Historic Commercial District*

Ms. Moore spoke regarding unapproved work on the left side of the building, the Mamas and the Tapas. Staff recommends removal of the T-111 railing and the new doors on the porch, as they do not meet the intent of the W. Gervais Street Historic Commercial Guidelines which are based upon the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.

Philip Rye, tenant of The Mamas and The Tapas, presented on this request.

Motion by Mr. Marshall to deny the request for Certificate of Design Approval for current unapproved exterior changes for 931 Senate Street; and require the applicant to bring the building into compliance with the design guidelines by removing the T-111 railing and the new doors on the porch. They do not meet the intent of the West Gervais Street Commercial Guidelines, which are based upon the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.

Also,

- a) **Staff to review and work out design and materials of any replacement railing which might be required by code;**
- b) **Staff review the painting the applicant has done, and bring the painting into compliance with the guidelines in terms of staff review;**
- c) **Any future porch enclosure to come back for full review; and**
- d) **All other details to be deferred to staff.**

Mr. Ross stated the applicant requested some time so he would be able to deliver on the conditions placed upon him. Mr. Rye mentioned 150 days, however Mr. Ross felt more comfortable with 120 days.

Mr. Marshall amended the motion to include that all work must be completed within 120 days.

Motion seconded by Mr. Harper. Motion to deny request passes 8-0.

- 6. 3231 Murray Street** (TMS#13902-10-29) Request for Certificate of Design Approval to replace gable windows and install new window. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*

Staci Richey, city planner, spoke on the request to replace three original windows in the gables of the building, and the addition of a new window in the left gable which would likely return it to its original appearance. The owner is requesting replacement with 6/6 pane configuration, wood, simulated divided lite windows, which does not meet Section 7-2 of the guidelines; therefore staff recommends denial. If the Commission approves the installation of a new window in the left gable that would replicate an original, true divided lite wood double hung sash window, it would meet the guidelines in Section 7-2. The applicant has indicated that the windows are in decent shape and can be repaired.

Mr. Ross stated this must be a two-part motion with regard to the removal and to the addition.

Motion by Mr. Marshall to grant the request for 3231 Murray Street Certificate of Design Approval to add an additional window on the left-side gable provided the window meets and complies with the requirements of the design guidelines for the district.

Defer to staff the review of the existing windows so staff can make a site visit to determine the reparability of the existing windows. Staff will then be able to determine if the windows are repairable, and the applicant would then repair the windows under the guidelines; or staff would determine the windows are not repairable and the applicant would have the option of putting in new windows that comply with the district guidelines.

Motion seconded by Mr. Monteith. Motion passes 8-0.

- 2914 Pickett Street (TMS#13901-18-03) Request for Certificate of Design Approval to install skylight. *Melrose Heights/Oak Lawn Architectural Conservation District*
DEFERRED
7. 804 Gervais Street (TMS# B08916-11-03) Request preliminary certification for the Bailey Bill. *W. Gervais Street Historic Commercial District*
DEFERRED

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

Discussion with members of the Tree and Appearance Committee

Andrew Whitfield, chairman of the Tree and Appearance Committee, and John McKenzie of the Tree and Appearance Committee gave an informational presentation on a project they are taking on to try and get some power lines in the City buried.

Mr. McKenzie said there is no funding for any type of underground utility burial in Columbia. SCEG has a program set up that the City can participate in. Many counties in the state are already doing this, as well as other states. Discussion of an increase in the franchise fee which would allow this to be done was discussed.

Mr. Fellows said as more information can be provided once more details are obtained from SCEG, and this project can be added to the January / February agenda.

Election of chair and vice-chair

Nominations were opened for positions of chair and vice-chair. Current chairperson, Mr. Ross' term will be up in January 2014, and vice-chairperson, Dr. Skinner's term will be up in February 2014.

Ms. Kaemmerlen nominated Mr. Marshall for chairperson and Beronica Whisnant for vice-chairperson. Both accepted the nominations with no opposition.

No other nominations were made, nominations closed.

Motion by Ms. Kaemmerlen to nominate Dale Marshall for chairperson and Beronica Whisnant for vice-chairperson. Motion seconded by Ms. Hildebrand. Motion passes 6-0.

Motion by Ms. Kaemmerlen to elect Dale Marshall for chairperson and Beronica Whisnant for vice-chairperson. Motion seconded by Ms. Hildebrand. Motion passes 6-0.

Incoming Commission members were introduced and welcomed.

**V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
November**

**Motion by Mr. Harper to approve the November 14, 2013 minutes; seconded by Ms. Kaemmerlen.
Minutes approved 8-0.**

VI. ADJOURN

**There being no further business, Motion to adjourn by Mr. Monteith seconded by Ms. Whisant.
Motion approved 8-0. Meeting adjourned at 5:32 PM**

Chairperson

Date

**Respectfully submitted
Planning and Development Services Department**