



The Columbia City Council conducted a Council Meeting and a Budget Public Hearing on Tuesday, June 7, 2016 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina. The Honorable Sam Davis called the meeting to order at 6:04 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, The Honorable Moe Baddourah, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall and The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin arrived at 7:35 p.m. The Honorable Leona K. Plough was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the Freedom of Information Act. *The minutes are numbered to coincide with the order of the meeting.*

### **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

### **INVOCATION**

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the Invocation.

### **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to adopt the agenda, subject to deferring consideration of [Ordinance No.: 2016-046](#).

### **PUBLIC INPUT RELATED TO AGENDA ITEMS**

*No one appeared at this time.*

### **CONSENT AGENDA**

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the **Consent Agenda Items 1 through 11 and 13 through 21**.

### **CONSIDERATION OF BIDS and AGREEMENTS**

1. Council is asked to approve the [Purchase of one \(1\) Ford F-550 Truck](#), as requested by the Fire Department. Award to Dick Smith Ford, using the SC State Contract in the amount of \$51,250.00. This vendor is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Fire Administration-Auto, Trucks, Heavy Equipment Capital 1012301-658500 – Note: The original budgeted amount is \$54,300.00. - Approved*

2. Council is asked to approve an [Agreement for Interim Services at the Hydroelectric Facility](#), as requested by the Assistant Manager for Operations Office. Award to Lockhart Power Company in an amount not to exceed \$52,000.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: 5511706-63660 – **Note:** The original budgeted amount is \$52,000.00. - Approved*
  
3. Council is asked to approve [Project SS738701; Flood Repair Services to Aerial Pipe at Euclid Avenue](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to G.H. Smith Construction, the lowest responsive bidder in the amount of \$54,800.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: 5516205-638400 – **Note:** This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and a SC Severe Storms and Flooding 2015 Project / FEMA DR-SC4241. The original budgeted amount is \$65,015.00 in the Fiscal Year 2015/2016 CIP. The following sub-consultants will receive \$7,500.00(13%) of the contract value. - Approved*

Sub-consultants	Locations	Services	Contract %	Amount
Fortiline Waterworks	Columbia, SC	Pipe/Casing	9%	\$5,000.00
Vulvan	Columbia, SC	Rip Rap/Rock	4%	\$2,500.00

4. Council is asked to approve the [Purchase of Twelve \(12\) Radios and Accessories](#), as requested by the General Services Department. Award to Motorola C&E, using the SC State Contract in the amount of \$63,698.40. This vendor is located in Blythewood, SC. *Funding Source: General Services Capital Replacement/Radio Equipment 6308972-627800 – **Note:** The original budgeted amount is \$63,698.40. - Approved*
  
5. Council is asked to approve an [On-Call Services Agreement for Project SS7320](#) in conjunction with the operation of the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to CH2M Hill Engineers, Inc. in the amount of \$75,000.00. This firm has headquarters in Colorado and a local office in Charlotte, NC. *Funding Source: Water Sewer Operations & Maintenance Budget 5516205-SS7320-638305 – **Note:** This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and the original budgeted amount is \$75,000.00. - Approved*
  
6. Council is asked to approve an [Agreement for Engineering Services to include Environmental Testing for the Water/Wastewater Maintenance Facility](#) at the intersection of English Avenue and West Beltline Boulevard, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to Terracon Consultants, Inc. in the amount of \$108,600.00. This firm has headquarters in Olathe, KS and a local office in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Water Sewer Capital, 5529999-SM419102-658650 and 5529999-SS7266-658650 – **Note:** The original budgeted amount is \$108,600.00 in the 2016 CIP. - Approved*

7. Council is asked to approve [Contract Amendment #3 Project SS7060](#); Refurbishment of the Wastewater Collection System at the Clearwater, Meadowland, Prescott Manor, Shady Lane, Swandale and Yacht Cove Pump Stations, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to American Engineering in the amount of \$108,965.00. This firm is located in Cayce, SC. *Funding Source: 5529999-SS7060-658650 – **Note:** This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and a Subcontracting Outreach Program Project. The original budgeted amount is \$372,000.00 in the Fiscal Year 2015/2016 CIP. The following sub-consultants will receive \$22,000.00(19.81%) of the contract value. - Approved*

Sub-consultants	Locations	Services	Contract %	Amount
Howard Engineering (WBE)	Marietta, SC	Electrical Engineering	13.77%	\$15,000.00
Case Consulting (MBE)	Columbia, SC	Structural Engineering	6.4%	\$7,000.00

8. Council is asked to approve [Change Order #1 for Project WM379101; Water Main Construction along Sylvan Drive, Shannon Springs Road and Briarfield Road](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to LAD Corporation of West Columbia in the amount of \$296,276.20. This firm is located in Swansea, SC. *Funding Source: \$100,000.00 will come from the owner's contingency allowance included in the original contract amount and the remaining funds of \$196,276.20 will come from savings from project WM300116 – **Note:** This is a Mentor Protégé Program Project and Lexington Earth Works of Swansea, SC is the Protégé. The original contract amount is \$1,409,022.60 and the revised contract amount is \$1,605,298.80 in the Fiscal Year 2015/2016 CIP. - Approved*

9. Council is asked to approve [Project SS7325; Starlite Pump Station Flow Study Services](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to Alliance Consulting Engineering, in the amount of \$315,315.00. This firm is a Minority Business Enterprise located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Capital Outlay Projects Budget 5529999-SS7325-658650 – **Note:** This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and a Mentor Protégé Program Project. 4D Engineering of Lexington, SC is the Protégé and will provide civil engineering services at \$63,063.00 (20%) of the contract value. The original budgeted amount is \$315,315.00 in the Fiscal Year 2015/2016 CIP. The following sub-consultants will receive \$110,190.00(34.95%) of the contract value. - Approved*

Sub-consultants	Locations	Services	Contract %	Amount
Hydrostructures, PA	Cayce, SC	Sewer Assessment	33.68%	\$106,190.00
Inman Surveying Co., Inc.	Columbia, SC	Surveying	1.27%	\$4,000.00

10. Council is asked to approve the [Purchase of Radios and Accessories](#), as requested by the Police Department. Award to Motorola C&E, using the SC State Contract in the amount of \$340,616.26. This vendor is located in Blythewood, SC. *Funding Source: \$244,766.26 will come from the Police Administrative Services/Radio Equipment Fund 1012402-627800 and \$95,850.00 will come from the US Justice Grants JAG Project/Radio Equipment Fund 9211000014-627800 – **Note:** The original budgeted amount is \$340,616.26. - Approved*
11. Council is asked to approve [Project SS7258; Gravity Sewer Route from Greenlawn Drive to Burnside #1 Pump Station](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to D.S. Utilities, the lowest responsive bidder in the amount of \$1,623,932.00. This firm is located in Little Mountain, SC. *Funding Source: 5529999-658650/SS725801-658650 – **Note:** This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and a Mentor Protégé Program Project. TNT, Inc. of Chapin, SC is the Protégé and will implement \$308,000.00 (20%) of the contract value. The original budgeted amount is \$1,853,000.00 in the Fiscal Year 15/16 CIP. The following sub-consultants will receive \$110,190.00(34.95%) of the contract value. - Approved*

Sub-consultants	Locations	Services	Contract %	Amount
Horizontal Unlimited (SBE)	Westminister, SC	Bore and Jack	1.96%	\$30,000.00
C.R. Jackson (SBE)	Columbia, SC	Milling & Jack	6.47%	\$99,125.00
Tindall (SBE)	Spartanburg, SC	Precast	5.61%	\$85,973.00
Fortiline (SBE)	Columbia, SC	HDPE	4.57%	\$70,000.00
Hobas Pipe (SBE)	Greensboro, NC	Pipe	16.99%	\$260,000.00

12. Council is asked to approve [Automatic Meter Reading/Advanced Metering Infrastructure Feasibility Study and Project Management Services for five \(5\) years](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to the CH2M Team in the amount of \$1,980,300.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Engineering-Special Water/Sewer Contract 5511706-638305 – **Note:** The original budgeted amount is \$2,000,000.00. - Approved*

Councilor Baddourah sought clarification on the cost for these services.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of Utilities and Engineering explained that up to \$170,000 is for a feasibility study. The remainder of the cost is for the CH2M Team to be the project manager through a five year implementation program. The total project cost is estimated at \$60 million. He explained that a pilot was conducted several years ago where we implemented a blend of AMR, which means that staff has to get close to the meter to read it and AMI, which means that meter readings are hard-wired and can be read daily.

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to approve Automatic Meter Reading/Advanced Metering Infrastructure Feasibility Study and Project Management Services for five (5) years, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to the CH2M Team in the amount of \$1,980,300.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN – FUTURE LAND USE MAP AMENDMENT –  
SECOND READING

13. [W/S National Guard Road](#), TMS#11100-01-15; E/S Congaree River, TMS# 11100-01-05 and 11100-01-06; and South of South Stadium Road/Southeast of Vine Street, TMS# 11201-02-10; request to confirm land use classification SD-1 (Sports/Amusement District). Property annexed April 19, 2016. – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District: 3  
Proposal: Amend the Future Land use Map in Chapter 8.3 of  
The Columbia Plan: 2018 for the subject parcels with a classification of SD-1  
Applicant: The University of South Carolina Development Foundation  
PC Recommendation: Approve (6-0); 03/07/16 – Interim Land Use  
PC Recommendation: Approve (6-0); 04/04/16 – Land Use  
Staff Recommendation: Approve Land Use Class of SD-1

Ordinance No.: 2016-034 – Amending the City of Columbia Comprehensive Plan 2018 Future Land Use Map to include W/S National Guard Road, Richland County TMS #11100-01-15; E/S Congaree River, Richland County TMS # 11100-01-05 and 11100-01-06; and SIS South Stadium Road and SE/S Vine Street, Richland County TMS #11201-02-10 annexed by Ordinance No.: 2016-020 enacted April 19, 2016 – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

ANNEXATION, COMPREHENSIVE PLAN MAP AMENDMENT & ZONING  
MAP AMENDMENT – SECOND READING

14. [E/S Spears Creek Church Road](#), TMS#25716-02-02; request to annex, assign land use classification AC-3 (Regional Activity Corridor), and zone the property PUD-C (Planned Unit Development - Commercial District). The property is currently classified as Neighborhood (Medium Density) and zoned PDD (Planned Development District) in Richland County. – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District: 4  
Proposal: Annex, assign land use classification AC-3 and zone property PUD-C  
Applicant: Grace Presbyterian Church (A.R.P.), Inc.  
1420 Lady Street, Columbia, SC 29201  
PC Recommendation: Approve (7-0); 04/04/16  
Staff Recommendation: Annex, assign AC-3 Land Use Classification and PUD-C Zoning

Ordinance No.: 2016-035 – Annexing and Incorporating 9 acres E/S Spears Creek Church Road, Richland County TMS #25716-02-02 into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 11, 2015 – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016.* – *Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

ZONING MAP AMENDMENT – SECOND READING

15. [W/S National Guard Road, TMS#11100-01-15; E/S Congaree River, TMS# 11100-01-05 and 11100-01-06; and South of South Stadium Road/Southeast of Vine Street, TMS# 11201-02-10;](#) request to rezone the properties as follows: D-1 (Development District) for TMS#s 11100-01-05, 11100-01-06, and 11201-02-10 with zoning of – FW (Floodway Area) and – FP (Floodplain Area) where applicable for each parcel; and M-1, -FP (Light Industrial District, Floodplain Area) for TMS# 11100-01-15. The properties are currently classified as Rural Large Lot/Mixed Residential (High Density) and zoned RU, M-1 and HI (Rural District, Light Industrial and Heavy Industrial) in Richland County. Property annexed April 19, 2016. – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016.* – *Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District: 3  
Proposal: Rezone parcels from interim zoning of D-1, -FW, -FP / M-1, -FP / D-1, -FP to zoning of D-1, -FW, -FP / M-1, -FP / D-1, -FP  
Applicant: The University of South Carolina Development Foundation  
PC Recommendation: Approve (6-0), 04/04/16  
Staff Recommendation: Approve

16. [N/S Devine Street, 2801 Devine Street;](#) TMS#11316-13-12, 11316-04-21; request to rezone from C-1 (Office and Institutional) to C-2 (Neighborhood Commercial). – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016.* – *Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District: 3  
Proposal: Rezone N/S Devine Street (TMS#11316-13-12) and 2801 Devine Street (TMS#11316-04-21) from C-1 to C-2.  
Applicant: Jimmy Williams; Devine Station, LLC  
PC Recommendation: Approve (4-2), 04/04/16; C-1 to C-2 (Devine Street Parcels)  
Staff Recommendation: Approve C-1 to C-2 (Devine Street Parcels)

ZONING MAP AND TEXT AMENDMENT – SECOND READING

17. [1634 Main Street](#), TMS#09014-04-19; request to rezone from C-5, -DD (Central Business District, -Design/Development Overlay District) to C-5, -DD, -DP (Central Business District, -Design/Development Overlay District, -Design Preservation). Amend Sec. 17-691 (d) to establish 1634 Main Street as a Group III individual historic landmark in the City of Columbia. – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District: 2  
Proposal: Rezone parcel from C-5, -DD to C-5, -DD, -DP and Amend Chapter 17 – Article V, Division 3 - §17-691(d) to designate structure as a Group III Landmark  
Applicant: Krista Hampton, Director of Planning and Development Services  
D/DRC: Approve (8-0); 02/11/16 - Landmark Status (-DP)  
PC Recommendation: Approve (7-0), 03/07/16  
Staff Recommendation: Approve

[Ordinance No.: 2016-022](#) – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 17, Planning, Land Development and Zoning, Article V, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review, Division 4, Landmarks, Sec. 17-691 Buildings and sites list, (d), to add 1634 Main Street, TMS #09014-04-19 – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

18. [1703 Wayne Street](#), TMS#09010-11-14; request to rezone from RG-3, -DD (Townhouse and High Rise Residential District, -Design/Development Overlay District) to RG-3, -DD, -DP (Townhouse and High Rise Residential District, -Design/Development Overlay District, -Design Preservation); and Amend Sec. 17-691 (d) to establish 1703 Wayne Street as a Group III individual historic landmark in the City of Columbia. – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District: 2  
Proposal: Rezone parcel from RG-3, -DD to RG-3, -DD, -DP and Amend Chapter 17 – Article V, Division 3 - §17-691(d) to designate structure as a Group III Landmark  
Applicant: Krista Hampton, Director of Planning and Development Services  
D/DRC: Approve (8-0); 03/10/16 - Landmark Status (-DP)  
PC Recommendation: Approve (7-0), 04/04/16  
Staff Recommendation: Approve

Ordinance No.: 2016-037 – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 17, Planning, Land Development and Zoning, Article V, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review, Division 4, Landmarks, Sec. 17-691 Buildings and sites list, (d), to add 1703 Wayne Street, TMS #09010-11-14 – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

19. [1608 Main Street](#), TMS#09014-04-14; request to rezone from C-5, -DD (Central Area Commercial District, -Design/Development Overlay District) to C-5, -DD, -DP (Central Area Commercial District, -Design/Development Overlay District, -Design Preservation); and Amend Sec. 17-691 (d) to establish 1608 Main Street as a Group III individual historic landmark in the City of Columbia. – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District: 2  
Proposal: Rezone parcel from C-5, -DD to C-5, -DD, -DP and Amend Chapter 17 – Article V, Division 3 - §17-691(d) to designate structure as a Group III Landmark  
Applicant: Krista Hampton, Director of Planning and Development Services  
D/DRC: Approve (7-0); 04/14/16 - Landmark Status (-DP)  
PC Recommendation: Approve (7-0), 04/04/16  
Staff Recommendation: Approve

Ordinance No.: 2016-038 – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 17, Planning, Land Development and Zoning, Article V, Historic Preservation and Architectural Review, Division 4, Landmarks, Sec. 17-691 Buildings and sites list, (d), to add 1608 Main Street, TMS #09014-04-14 – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

TEXT AMENDMENT – SECOND READING

20. [Recommendation to City Council to Amend § 17-283 \(Wireless Communication Facilities – Cell Tower\) with a version that reflects current technology and law.](#) – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Proposal: Amend Chapter 17, Article III, Division 8, Amend §17-283 (Wireless communication facilities – cell tower) with a version that reflects current technology and law.  
Applicant: K. Brian Cook, Zoning Administrator  
PC Recommendation: Approve (7-0), 04/04/16 with condition to remove subsection (i)(14) from new version  
Staff Recommendation: Approve

[Ordinance No.: 2016-027](#) – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 17, Planning, Land Development and Zoning, Article III, Zoning, Division 8, District Descriptions; Use and Dimensional Regulations, Sec. 17-283 Wireless Communication Facilities - Cell Tower – *First reading approval was given on May 17, 2016. – Second reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

#### EVENT RESOLUTIONS

21. [Resolution No.: R-2016-032](#) – Authorizing consumption of beer and wine beverages only at the Palmetto Tasty Tomato Festival on July 16, 2016 - *Approved*

#### PRESENTATIONS

22. [National Homeownership Month Proclamation](#) – The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said it is very fitting that we would have a National Homeownership Month Proclamation tonight. All of us are truly saddened by the loss of our Community Development Director, Ms. Deborah Christie formerly known as Deborah Livingston. She still rests heavily in our hearts. We’ve provided you with a photo and a poem “The Dash” by Linda Ellis that she shared with her staff before going out on medical leave.

Councilor Davis agreed that Ms. Christie left her mark on community development in this City; her leadership has earned numerous national awards; and she stood shoulder to shoulder with her colleagues across the country.

The members of City Council proclaimed June 2016 as National Homeownership Month in the City of Columbia and presented the Preserve the Dream Award to Ms. Leslie Elmore, a homeowner that utilized the City Lender I Program.

Councilor Devine acknowledged how wonderful all of the Community Development staff is. She said the last few weeks have been hard, but they have not skipped a beat. She commended them for their hard work.

23. [Music Month Proclamation](#) – The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin

The members of City Council proclaimed June 2016 as Columbia Music Month in the City of Columbia.

**ANNEXATION, COMPREHENSIVE PLAN MAP AMENDMENT & ZONING MAP AMENDMENT – FIRST READING**

24. [825 Abernathy Street and 7660- Garners Ferry Road](#), TMS#16314-01-02 and 16314-01-03; request to annex, assign land use classification Community Activity Corridor (AC-2) and assign zoning of RG-2 (General Residential). The property is currently classified as undeveloped and zoned GC (General Commercial) in Richland County. – *The Public Hearing was held on May 17, 2016 and first reading consideration was deferred. - First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District: 3  
Proposal: Annex, assign land use classification AC-2 and zone property RG-2  
Applicant: Shandon Terrace, LLC  
PC Recommendation: Approve (6-0); 03/07/16  
Staff Recommendation: Annex, assign AC-2 Land Use Classification and RG-2 Zoning

[Ordinance No.: 2016-021](#) – Annexing and Incorporating 825 Abernathy Street and 7660 Garners Ferry Road, Richland County TMS #16314-01-02 and 16314-01-03 into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 Abernathy 7660 Garners Ferry – *The Public Hearing was held on May 17, 2016 and first reading consideration was deferred. - First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Councilor Baddourah asked the developer to address traffic concerns.

Mr. Bill Chamblin, Director of Development for Connelly Development reported that SCODT required the developer to complete a traffic study during peak hours and there was less than a 1% impact on the roadway. He said they are installing a right turn lane on Garners Ferry Road and repaving Abernathy Street. He said their intent is to be a good neighbor.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to a *Zoning Map Amendment* for 825 Abernathy Street and 7660 Garners Ferry Road, TMS#16314-01-02 and 16314-01-03; request to annex, assign land use classification Community Activity Corridor (AC-2) and assign zoning of RG-2 (General Residential). The property is currently classified as undeveloped and zoned GC (General Commercial) in Richland County **and** Ordinance No.: 2016-021 – Annexing and Incorporating 825 Abernathy Street and 7660 Garners Ferry Road, Richland County TMS #16314-01-02 and 16314-01-03 into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 Abernathy 7660 Garners Ferry.

## **ZONING MAP AMENDMENT – FIRST READING**

25. [1829, 1859 and 1863 West Buchanan Drive](#); TMS#13907-03-28, -29, and -30; request to rezone from RS-1 (Single-Family Residential) to RS-2 (Single-Family Residential). –Public Hearing was held on May 17, 2016. – *The Public Hearing was held on May 17, 2016 and first reading consideration was deferred. – First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Council District:	4
Proposal:	Rezone parcels from RS-1, -FP to RS-2, -FP
Applicant:	John B. Blackmon
PC Recommendation:	Approve (7-0), 03/7/16
Staff Recommendation:	Deny

Councilor Devine asked Ms. Hampton if she agreed that this project would have a minimal impact on runoff.

Ms. Krista Hampton, Director of Planning and Development Services deferred to the expertise of Erich Miarka, Director of the Gills Creek Watershed Association.

Councilor Duvall said he lives one block away from this site and this is not a bad request. He said the lot drains towards the north and away from West Buchanan. This is a very minimal thing we can do for these people that were completely flooded out on October 4, 2015.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted four (4) to one (1) to give first reading approval to the *Zoning Map* Amendment for 1829, 1859 and 1863 West Buchanan Drive; TMS#13907-03-28, -29, and -30; request to rezone from RS-1 (Single-Family Residential) to RS-2 (Single-Family Residential). Voting aye were Mr. McDowell, Mr. Duvall, Ms. Devine and Mr. Davis. Mr. Baddourah voted nay.

## **ORDINANCES – FIRST READING**

26. [Ordinance No.: 2016-023](#) – Granting encroachment to St. Luke Lutheran Church for directional signs on the southwest corner of Whaley Street and Wayne Street – *First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-023 – Granting encroachment to St. Luke Lutheran Church for directional signs on the southwest corner of Whaley Street and Wayne Street.

27. [Ordinance No.: 2016-028](#) – Granting an encroachment to the University of South Carolina for the use of the right of way areas of the 600 and 700 blocks of Park Street for installation and maintenance of bollards, parking spaces, accessible ramp with handrails, irrigation, curbing, gutters and sidewalks adjacent to the Carolina Coliseum at 701 Assembly Street, Richland County TMS #08915-08-01 – *First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-028 – Granting an encroachment to the University of South Carolina for the use of the right of way areas of the 600 and 700 blocks of Park Street for installation and maintenance of bollards, parking spaces, accessible ramp with handrails, irrigation, curbing, gutters and sidewalks adjacent to the Carolina Coliseum at 701 Assembly Street, Richland County TMS #08915-08-01.

28. [Ordinance No.: 2016-029](#) – Granting an encroachment to the Knights of Columbus for installation and maintenance of brick pavers and sod within the right of way area of the 1600 block of Marion Street adjacent to its building at 1623 Marion Street, Richland County TMS #09014-05-05 – *First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-029 – Granting an encroachment to the Knights of Columbus for installation and maintenance of brick pavers and sod within the right of way area of the 1600 block of Marion Street adjacent to its building at 1623 Marion Street, Richland County TMS #09014-05-05.

29. [Ordinance No.: 2016-030](#) – Granting an encroachment to Seth Thorp and Mae Young for installation and maintenance of a wrought iron fence within the right of way area of the 1800 block of Combahee Avenue adjacent to 329 Edisto Avenue, Richland County TMS #11311-01-02 – *First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-030 – Granting an encroachment to Seth Thorp and Mae Young for installation and maintenance of a wrought iron fence within the right of way area of the 1800 block of Combahee Avenue adjacent to 329 Edisto Avenue, Richland County TMS #11311-01-02.

30. [Ordinance No.: 2016-046](#) – An Eleventh Supplemental Ordinance providing for the Issuance and Sale of City of Columbia, South Carolina, Waterworks and Sewer System Revenue Bonds, in one or more series, in the aggregate principal amount of not exceeding \$281,000,000, in order to refinance certain outstanding indebtedness and to finance various Capital Projects and Improvements to the system, any necessary debt service reserves and issuance costs; authorizing the Mayor, the City Manager and the Assistant City Manager for Finance and Economic Services, or any two of them acting together, to determine certain matters with respect to the bonds; prescribing the form and details of such bonds; adopting continuing disclosure procedures; and other matters relating thereto – *Consideration of this item was deferred.*

### **RESOLUTIONS**

31. [Resolution No.: R-2016-037](#) – Authorizing the City Manager to execute and ratifying the execution of an Agreement for Wastewater Treatment and Disposal by and between the City of Columbia and Palmetto of Richland, LLC - *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2016-037 – Authorizing the City Manager to execute and ratifying the execution of an Agreement for Wastewater Treatment and Disposal by and between the City of Columbia and Palmetto of Richland, LLC.

### **OTHER MATTERS**

32. [Conflict of Interest Waiver for Community Assistance Providers, Inc.](#) – Ms. Dollie Bristow, Community Development Administrator

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager explained that this is a standard waiver that we've done in the past.

Councilor Devine asked the City Attorney if she needed to leave the room.

Ms. Teresa Knox, Esq., City Attorney said no.

Ms. Dollie Bristow, Community Development Administrator explained that the Community Development Department requested an exception to the HOME Investment Partnership Program regulations regarding a potential or perceived conflict of interest for Community Assistance Partners. The organization has requested HOME funds from the City of Columbia and as a standard procedure we must disclose this to the public as part of HUD regulation.

The Council accepted this as information and no action was taken.

## **APPOINTMENTS**

33. [Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee](#) – *Consideration of this item was deferred.*

34. [Citizens Advisory Committee](#)

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Mr. Marvin Heller to the Citizens Advisory Committee.

35. [Columbia Tree and Appearance Commission](#)

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Mr. William Baker to the Columbia Tree and Appearance Commission as at-large representative.

36. [Climate Protection Action Committee](#) – *Consideration of this item was deferred.*

Councilor Baddourah volunteered to serve as chairman of the Climate Protection Action Committee.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager clarified that the committee requested that the chair not be a member of City Council. They even made a recommendation on the appointment.

37. [Planning Commission](#)

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Ms. LaTrell Hart to the Planning Commission.

38. [Property Maintenance Board of Appeals](#)

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve the re-appointment of Ms. Kathryn Fenner and Mr. Jeff Caswell and the appointment of Ms. Carolyn Sawyer, Mr. Michael Bailey and Mr. William Scott Barnes to the Property Maintenance Board and Appeals.

## **OTHER MATTERS**

39. [Traffic Calming Measures](#) – Mr. Robert Anderson, Public Works Director

Mr. Robert Anderson, Public Works Director presented an overview of the speed hump policy in the City of Columbia. He noted that the requests and placement of speed humps have continued to increase over the last five years. A number of studies were conducted and it was found that there was no real impact on law enforcement vehicles, but it increased fire and emergency services response time by two to ten seconds. The study also showed that

speed humps can damage the vehicle frames of fire trucks and EMS apparatus. He reviewed the pending neighborhood requests for speed humps. He asked Council to adopt a list of speed hump guidelines that were derived from the Department of Transportation handbook.

Councilor Devine expressed concerns with balancing the guidelines with the livability of neighborhoods.

Mr. Aubrey Jenkins, Columbia Fire Chief said he is concerned about the potential damages that can be caused when a fire truck goes over an uneven surface and experiences delayed response times.

Councilor McDowell asked if the guidelines represent areas where there is a school or business on the same street.

Mr. Robert Anderson, Public Works Director said it has to do with traffic volumes and SCDOT won't approve requests on roads with high traffic volumes.

Councilor Davis said we tend to support the request of the neighborhood based on safety concerns, but I understand not putting them on major corridors. He said speed humps can help to calm traffic in neighborhoods that are used as a cut through.

Mr. Aubrey Jenkins, Columbia Fire Chief asked Council to consider how many speed humps are placed in an area.

Councilor Baddourah said we have direct communications with neighborhood presidents and residents. The requests are voted on by the neighborhood associations. He said every situation is different. The policy should also consider roads with and without sidewalks, the number of pedestrians, and other options. He said Wheeler Hill also asked about speed humps.

Mr. Robert Anderson, Public Works Director noted that we build speed humps as close to DOT standards as possible and chevrons and signage are added.

Councilor McDowell said he hopes the guidelines are flexible enough to consider all parameters as we conduct our assessment.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager echoed Mr. McDowell's sentiments. She said we are getting to a point where communities are asking for speed humps and we are putting them in. As the manager, she doesn't think that is appropriate without the proper assessment. She said there are additional measures that need to be taken into account. We have many requests and it isn't always well received when staff attempts to provide alternatives. We are not suggesting that we not do speed humps and we are conscience of the issues that the Fire Department is facing. We wanted to make sure that Council defer requests back to staff before we approve blanket requests for speed humps. She agreed to refine the proposed policy and bring it back to Council.

Councilor Devine asked where staff is with recommendations on other traffic calming measures. We need to be in a position to offer alternatives to neighborhoods. She asked about Cottowntown's request for bump-outs.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked staff to include these other options as part of a streamlined approach to traffic calming measures.

### **ORDINANCES – FIRST READING**

40. [Ordinance No.: 2016-042](#) – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 2, Administration, Article I, In General, Article II, Mayor and Council, Article III, Officers and Employees and Article 1, Procurement – *First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016, subject to amending the ordinance to include Section 2-59 Council committees and special committees and 2-61 Remote meeting.*

Councilor Duvall moved approval of Ordinance 2016-042 as amended by the Technology Committee's recommendation to include Sections 2-59 and 2-61. These amendments follow the 2005 Attorney General's opinion about allowing remote attendance at meetings and remote voting at meetings. We are leaving some of the restrictions open, because you would physically attend the meeting unless there was an emergency.

Councilor Devine noted that this policy includes Council meetings and committee meetings.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-042 – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 2, Administration, Article I, In General, Article II, Mayor and Council, Article III, Officers and Employees and Article 1, Procurement, subject to amending the ordinance to include Section 2-59 Council committees and special committees and 2-61 Remote meeting.

### **BUDGET PUBLIC HEARING**

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director presented the fiscal year 2016/2017 budget. She reviewed the proposed operating budgets in a total amount of \$315 million, which is a \$22 million increase over the prior year. The largest operating budget is water and sewer. This year's budget priorities include investments in public safety and neighborhood improvement initiatives; infrastructure needs; and restoring the competitiveness of the City's compensation plan. The General Fund Budget is \$138,800,868, which is a 5.8% increase from the previous year without a property tax mileage or other rate increase. The General Fund revenues total \$124,275,368 with a total net increase of \$8,072,810, which is a 5.8% increase. The General Fund expenditures total \$138,800,068 with Public Safety being the highest. There are a variety of new and expanded programs to include residential and commercial code enforcement including four (4) new positions; shift operations at the City's Animal Shelter to include five (5) new positions and moving towards becoming a no-kill shelter; Greenview Family Aquatic Center with twenty-one (21) new

part-time positions; Fifth Circuit Public Defender funding; back office operations to include one (1) new Accounting Tech; and the Façade Improvement Program at \$100,000 for expansion through the Two Notch corridor. The General Capital Projects include a new building for Hampton Park, bathrooms at Southeast Park, playground equipment at Finlay Park; and the City's portion to replace the Fire Department's self-contained breathing apparatus. The Capital Replacement Program budget is \$8 million and it includes vehicles/heavy equipment for the following departments: Fire, Public Works, Parks and Recreation, General Services, Planning and Development Services, Information Technology, and police and technology replacements. She noted that this is for vehicle replacements and not fleet expansions. The budget for the Water and Sewer Fund is \$148,467,000, which is an 11% increase. This budget includes a 4.2% rate increase and the revenue generated from the rate increase will be allocated to the Capital Improvement Program offsetting what we would have to borrow. The Water and Sewer budget also includes a transfer of budgeted cash in the amount of \$19.6 million to the Capital Improvement Program and \$10 million for the City's flood recovery program. The Capital Improvement Program is budgeted at \$140 million, which is an increase of \$20 million to fund additional water quality projects and the automated meter reading conversion. She noted that the transfer to the General Fund for Public Safety has been eliminated. The water and sewer budget increases are impacted by the Clean Water 2020 Program to meet the EPA Consent Decree requirements, an increase in debt service, and increased budgeted reserves. The projected net water and sewer revenue is \$14,646,855, which is an 11% increase including the 4.2% rate increase. The majority of the water and sewer budget is for the Utilities and Engineering Department, which includes funding for projects under the operations and maintenance programs of the City's water and sewer system that would not be capitalized. She noted that debt service is budgeted at approximately \$31 million, which is a 7% increase. The water and sewer expenditures total \$148,467,700. Expanded programs in the Water and Sewer Fund focus on the Clean Water 2020 Program and new positions, associated equipment and supplies. The Water and Sewer Capital Improvement Program is \$140 million, which is a \$20 million increase that will be allocated to the Water Improvement Program for additional water quality projects. The total for Water Capital Improvement Projects is \$60 million and the total for the Wastewater System budget is \$80 million and the majority of those projects will address the Clean Water Consent Decree deliverables. The Water and Sewer CIP is funded with cash in the amount of \$19.6 million and the remainder will be funded with bond proceeds and cash. The Storm Water Fund budget is \$7,135,000, which is a 1% increase. The Storm Water Capital Improvement Program budget is \$6 million and is funded with a \$1.8 million transfer from the Storm Water budget and cash reserves. Public Works is the largest department funded out of the Storm Water Fund for the operations and maintenance side of the storm water system. The Storm Water CIP focuses on meeting the EPA requirements and the MS4 permit. She recalled that staff was asked to consider evaluating the feasibility of issuing a bond for Storm Water CIP in the upcoming year as well as evaluating the rates. She noted that at some point cash reserves will not be available to fund the CIP. The Parking Fund is budgeted at \$8.2 million and reflects an increase of \$947,000, which is a 13% increase. This budget reflects the use of fund balance. The Parking Fund Capital Improvement Program is \$693,500 and it includes a \$500,000 transfer to the General Fund. The largest expenditure in the Parking Fund is for operations and debt service. The Hospitality Tax budget is proposed at \$10.8 million and revenues are projected at \$10.7 million, which is a \$380,000 increase. She noted

that we are seeing continued moderate growth in hospitality tax collections. The budget reflects the use of fund balance in the amount of \$43,800, which is significantly less than the prior year's use of fund balance. Allocations to external organizations total \$5.2 million, which includes allocations for two (2) capital projects. The Hospitality Tax Advisory Committee budget is \$1.8 million that will be allocated to organizations that submit applications. The transfer to the General Fund is \$3 million and debt service is \$2.6 million. The Accommodations Tax Budget is \$2.1 million, which is a 1.2% increase over the current year. The Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee budget is \$1.9 million and \$113,800 is budgeted for general purposes that include committee expenses, the Together We Can Read initiative and ONE Columbia. She acknowledged City Council's work on the City of Columbia Vision Statement and Work Plan. The second reading and final adoption of the budget is scheduled for June 21, 2016 and the fiscal year starts on July 1, 2016. In conclusion, Ms. Caughman acknowledged the awards and recognitions received by the City of Columbia during 2016.

**Mayor Benjamin arrived at 7:35 p.m.**

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager acknowledged City Council and their hard work with visioning and work planning. In July, she hopes to provide proposed dates for making this a process that we engage in annually during October. She highlighted page 2 of the Budget in Brief, which outlines Council's priorities.

**Council opened the Budget Public Hearing at 7:40 p.m.**

Mr. Bernard Chapman said everyone downstairs at City Hall made him feel welcome. He appeared before Council as a resident of Richland County and requested that City Council not raise the water and sewer rates. He said County Councilwoman Dixon put him in touch with Connie Lucius, who was a great representation for the City of Columbia. He applauded the City's Water Works system and the City's efforts after the flood. He asked Council not to raise the rates.

Ms. Jennifer Gardner said \$350,000 is being allocated for four (4) additional code enforcement officials. She asked what that includes. She said storm drains in neighborhoods are not kept clean by the residents. She thinks neighbors should take care of their storm drains.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director said funding for code enforcement officials includes personnel and operating costs.

Ms. Jennifer Gardner said code enforcement officers previously covered a two (2) square mile area. She asked if that is still the case.

Mayor Benjamin said cities across the state are stepping up efforts to make sure we have clean, safe, vibrant and livable cities; this is a reflection of that.

Ms. Jennifer Gardner objected to the City getting four (4) new code enforcement officers.

**Council closed the Budget Public Hearing at 7:51 p.m.**

ORDINANCES – FIRST READING

41. [Ordinance No.: 2016-036](#) – To Raise Revenue and Adopt the Budget for the City of Columbia, South Carolina, for the Fiscal Year ending June 30, 2017 – *First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016.*

Councilor Baddourah asked to approve the budget by department.

Mr. Duvall moved to adopt Ordinance No.: 2016-036 – To Raise Revenue and Adopt the Budget for the City of Columbia, South Carolina, for the Fiscal Year ending June 30, 2017. Ms. Devine seconded the motion.

Councilor Duvall opined that the adoption of the budget is the most important thing that City Councils do during the course of a year; it's the budget that sets the course of action for the City and it gives the City Manager marching orders. We have a fiduciary responsibility to make sure that we know what's in this budget and that we are thoroughly indoctrinated with the figures. I don't think we've been given nearly enough information as to the nuts and bolts of the budget. He acknowledged that the October flood was a traumatic event for our City and our staff and our budget director was pulled away from her responsibilities to help with flood recovery. He continued to say that we have two rookies on Council that are trying to get up to speed and we had a late Council retreat. All of these things have led me to a frustration over the intensity of the numbers going into the budget. He said he felt better after meeting with the City Manager and the Budget Director. He said the Budget Director has given him a model that we can work with next year that would give us a lot more information. The budget is only a yard stick and the ordinance can be amended during the year. He pledged as a new council member to get acquainted with the information in the budget. He said that Council hasn't been given enough information, but he plans to vote for the budget.

Councilor Davis said staff has done a good job and I'm usually comfortable with getting answers to my questions. I understand where we are and how we got to this point. We made a conscience decision to eliminate the transfer. A budget is for a 12-month period. I can live with the decisions we've made up to this point. The budget is fluid and we can adjust the ship. My only reservation with the overall budget is that I am not in support of the rate increase for water and sewer. I have heartburn with back to back increases knowing that it will be hard for folks that are on fixed incomes.

Councilor McDowell said this is my first go round and it makes a tremendous difference when you have capable staff crunching numbers in such a way that it will lead to something that will benefit our city. He said he was initially for the rate increase, but he will probably not vote for a rate increase.

Councilor Devine thanked Mr. Duvall for pointing out some of the challenges staff had this year. Staff was trying very early on to have a retreat with Council, go over priorities and to have budget discussions, but a lot of things hindered that. With the time and constraints they were given, they did an excellent job. She said the budget was \$7 million out of budget and over a variety of weeks they brought us a balanced budget that reflects the direction this City needs to be going while looking at internal needs, our responsibilities to the general community and other organizations, our parks and the capital improvement program. This is an excellent budget. She reiterated that Council needs to stick to looking at our future and priorities and making sure that we are working with our staff to get to where we need to be. We have to make investments now into the things that will give us the return that we need in the future. We need to look at how we fund the bigger ticket items and expanding or implementing new programs. Staff has done a good job and I challenge us to continue to work with staff to move in the right direction and not get so wrapped up in having a flat budget or no increase that we lose sight of the future and the investments we need to make to ensure that future Councils are left in a good position to continue to grow.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-036 – To Raise Revenue and Adopt the Budget for the City of Columbia, South Carolina, for the Fiscal Year ending June 30, 2017.

42. [Ordinance No.: 2016-040](#) – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 23, Utilities and Engineering, Article V, Water and Sewer Rates, Sec. 23-143 Water service rates and Sec. 23-149 Sewer service rates - *Council voted four (4) to two (2) to approve the Water and Sewer Budget without the 4.2% rate increase and to direct staff to bring back a budget that reflects cuts on the water side of the budget at the next meeting.*

Ms. Devine moved to approve Ordinance No.: 2016-040 – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 23, Utilities and Engineering, Article V, Water and Sewer Rates, Sec. 23-143 Water service rates and Sec. 23-149 Sewer service rates. Mr. Duvall seconded the motion.

Councilor Devine said we all live on a budget; however, as a utility we have a responsibility to make investments in our system and be able to raise the revenue to make those investments. She said the effect of the increase is nominal compared to the investment we are making. The residents of Booker Washington Heights have talked about brown water. I live in a neighborhood that has brown water. Had we done that project when we initially said we would do it, the issues in Earlewood, Cottontown and Booker Washington Heights would have been addressed earlier. We eliminated the transfer. We have an aggressive but doable capital plan and if we don't move forward with the proposed increase some of the projects won't get done and some neighborhoods will continue to have brown water and low water pressure. It's not easy to raise rates, but we have the responsibility of doing what's in the best interest of everyone. I will be supporting the 4% increase for water and sewer.

Councilor Duvall endorsed Ms. Devine's remarks. He asked his colleagues to look at page 28 of the Budget in Brief. He said the monthly increase will be \$2 per month for water and \$4 per month for sewer for an investment in our system that is sorely needed. This 4.02% rate increase is modest and if it isn't done, we will be looking at double digit increases in the future to catch up. He hopes that his colleagues understand that this isn't easy to do, but we were elected to make tough decisions. We need the rate increase to provide quality water for the citizens of Columbia.

Mayor Benjamin said while a budget is a yard stick; it is also a very clear reflection of our priorities and our values. He noted that this rate increase still keeps us lower than other cities in the region and we are below our affordability index. If we do not have a modest increase this year, we will have a double digit increase in the future. We will also have a significant increase in what we pay for deferred maintenance as seen in our roads all across South Carolina. If we vote against this rate increase now, we are voting for rusty pipes, sanitary sewer overflows in our river and in direct opposition to our moral and legal obligations as we deal with the EPA and the Consent Decree. We are looking at a 3-3 vote and to not move forward to continue to invest in our water and sewer system would be a grave mistake by this Council. I hope and I pray that you will reconsider your positions. We have a legal obligation to the citizens of this City to continue to improve our system. This is the time to make investments in our system. Interest rates are as low as they have been in a generation. They will begin to go up soon and the ability to issue tax exempt debt will cost more money next year.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager referenced a letter from the Environmental Protection Agency in reference to the Consent Decree. The Consent Decree was in place before the flooding and we have made great strides to ensure that the infrastructure of this City could handle a catastrophic event. While we talk about the Canal and being under an unprecedented boil water advisory for many days, we never lost water. We had pump stations that did not fail and that's because of the work and investments that were made leading up to the flood. After a visit with our staff and a tour of our facilities on April 22, 2016, the EPA acknowledged that we experienced a force majeure event that was unprecedented. Under strict conditions and guidelines, the EPA has granted us extended time frames to get the work done as a result of the Consent Decree deliverables. That is not something that the EPA would do lightly if they considered that we would not be able to move forward with the projects as they were outlined. I am very appreciative that they have granted us this consideration; it is not taken lightly.

Mayor Benjamin said we need more discussion on this issue. He asked his colleagues to present other ideas if they are not in favor of this budget.

Councilor Davis said he needed to look at the numbers for some of the projects that are in jeopardy, because we have started some of the projects that will be completed without this rate increase.

Councilor Devine said with this increase Earlewood is not scheduled to be done until 2019.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of Utilities and Engineering said without the increase we would still move forward with some projects, but it could delay the time. We would move forward with the CIP, but we may not move forward with AMR/AMI and some of the water quality projects. In order for us to stay on track with everything, we'd be looking at double digit rate increases. The intent is to keep the increases smoothed out so that we don't have extreme rate increases in the future.

Councilor Davis said what is modest to one person may not be modest to another. He said there are areas in this City that haven't received attention when we did have dollars. If we are always considering rate increases then we owe constituents opportunities to soften the impact through alternatives or rebates and we haven't done that. He asked how the assistance that we're getting as a result of the flood will impact the necessity for a rate increase.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager suggested that the assistance we are getting for work done on flood repairs will hopefully put us back where we were; it will not progress us further with projects and I wouldn't factor that in.

Councilor Davis said our challenge has always been that every effort to meet the needs of the City uses general fund resources. We have to figure out other ways to address our infrastructure and by doing so we will soften the blow to our citizens. I support reasonable investments in our system, but this will be a back to back increase.

Mayor Benjamin cited the list of water projects from page 24 of the Budget in Brief. We are talking about our ability to use cash as opposed to borrowing money. No one wants to vote for a rate increase or a tax increase. It is our obligation to make sure that we do it. We need to have a budget by June 30<sup>th</sup> and time is of the essence.

Councilor Duvall referenced a letter from HomeServe, a firm that has a contract with the City of Columbia through 2019. Through this contract it was last reported that we have over \$100,000 in an account that is for assistance with paying utility bills. We can develop a program to help low income individuals that cannot pay their bills. We need a rate increase to provide quality water for our citizens. He said nineteen (19) areas were identified with brown water. He said Flint, Michigan is a perfect example of what happens to a utility system when you don't invest in it. We need to pass this budget with a rate increase. We chose to do the 4% to even the increases out over the years. He urged his colleagues to agree to the rate increase and to agree to the budget.

Councilor Devine asked staff to explain the process for the completion of a project and the impact of not allocating funding.

Ms. Melissa Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations explained that larger projects are done over multiple years; the engineering is done in year one and construction the next year. For example, if we can't fund the design of Booker Washington Heights next year, then everything from that point forward slips ahead. The design includes easements and encroachments and that dictates when everything else will happen. She said smaller lines are easier to complete.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of Utilities and Engineering said the Earlewood project was designed two to three years ago. It has been in the CIP for a number of years. We will finalize the project in 2019, but the schedule is more aggressive.

Councilor Davis said everything is bottlenecked so we need a rate increase. Every year I've looked at the projects in the CIP. He referred to the Randall Street ditch, noting that it's not finished. When we took the tour I stopped the bus at a house with water washing away the foundation and we haven't touched that. I don't understand why we never got to Booker Washington and Earlewood. I don't know how we go about making priorities. He said brown water does not happen overnight if we are maintaining and monitoring the system.

Mayor Benjamin said we have iron pipes all across the country.

Councilor Davis said not supporting the rate increase doesn't mean that you don't support the people you represent; that is not the case. The back to back rate increase does impact folks. When we started this discussion I didn't support it and we haven't looked at any other way.

Councilor Baddourah said he has heard a lot of implications about voting against the rate increase. I take that seriously. I am a proponent for clean water and having no more brown water. We discussed every rate increase; we discussed how you were going to start the process and how it will affect a lot of people. We bought that line for the past three or four water rate increases and it's not happening. We still have brown water and problems with sewer lines. We passed Bull Street three years ago and every single water and sewer budget we pass we allocate a minimum of one to two million to Bull Street; it is unfair for residents to drink brown water when the new Bull Street development is getting brand new everything and they haven't paid a dime of taxes. This water rate increase will not affect the projects. There is \$4 million on Bull Street that you can eliminate and that will make up the 4% increase. This is not fair for the City of Columbia or our Council members. It is time to look at the residents who are getting brown water, even in Richland County. He said we are allocating \$11 million to Crane Creek and that's not in the City. I'm not voting for a rate increase.

Mayor Benjamin noted that Crane Creek is a sewer project. He made a motion to approve the water and sewer budget without the rate increase and to remove the following projects: AMR/AMI, Sumter Street, Covenant Road, Lake Katherine, and Washington Park. That would give us \$20 million to work with and that would negate the immediate need for the 4.2%. No one seconded the motion.

Councilor Baddourah argued that the 4% rate increase only represented \$4 million, not \$20 million.

Mayor Benjamin contended that it is a mix of cash and the ability to leverage debt to make these investments; it's not just \$4 million in the ground.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said she asked staff to pull the rate scenarios in case Council decides to go in another direction. She said brown water has been a big focus nationwide. She said the quality of our water is good, but there are communities who are suffering with discoloration that is not a result of lead; we have very high quality drinking water. That does not mean that the communities you named in particular are not a priority for making sure discoloration is no longer there. She asked for staff to review the different scenarios with Council in an effort to move forward with the sewer projects as outlined. She cautioned Council about the high dollar penalties that we will face from the federal government if we don't meet these timelines.

Mr. Baddourah made a motion to remove the \$2 million AMI project from the budget and to take \$2 million from Bull Street.

Councilor Devine said we are contractually obligated to provide the infrastructure for Bull Street. She agreed to allow staff to recommend what gets cut.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said if Council was more interested in not seeing an increase this year, they could possibly consider scenario 1A, but there would be significant increases in future years. This scenario would not allow for AMI and other water quality projects.

Councilor Baddourah said the numbers will change, because this City is growing. He agreed to table the motion to remove the \$2 million AMI project from the budget and to take \$2 million from Bull Street until Council receives more information.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we conduct a rate study every year knowing that there is more growth. She said you would have to look at scenarios 1A and 2A if you didn't want a rate increase this year. If we had that indication then we could review the projects that would be impacted by the scenario.

Mr. McDowell moved that Council reconvene at the appropriate time to look at projects that can be cut. Mr. Baddourah seconded the motion.

Councilor Duvall suggested that Council approve the water and sewer budget on first reading without the rate increase and to direct staff to come back with a reconfigured water and sewer budget minus the 4.2% rate increase.

Councilor Devine concurred with Mr. Duvall. She said we don't need to be cutting projects. She recalled that staff gave Council a detailed list of projects to be funded with a certain amount of funding in a previous meeting. She said all of this information was presented in multiple budget workshops; we had ample time to go over this with staff.

Mr. Duvall made an amended motion to pass first reading of the water and sewer budget minus the 4.2% rate increase and staff is to come back with a budget that reflects cuts on the water side.

Councilor Davis said he wants to know what project is more important than resolving brown water. As long as those projects have represented urgency, we should have fixed it.

Mayor Benjamin recommended that Council remove all motions from the table and have staff come back with budget recommendations based on scenario 1a or 2a.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked if Council wanted recommendations on scenario 1a versus scenario 2a.

Mayor Benjamin said you will have to reprioritize and cut projects on the water side. We have legal obligations with some projects; several projects are revenue generating opportunities for the system; and some projects deal with rusty water. It is a grave mistake for this Council not to invest in the system. I am prepared to not support this motion.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager sought further clarification on the motion.

Mayor Benjamin said Council is interested in exactly what this list of water projects will look like without the cash and the leveraged cash projects that will be funded in a prioritized manner through new money coming in.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said everything would stay the same if we go with scenario 2a, but the increases will be more in the years to come.

Councilor Baddourah said he is okay with scenario 2a.

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted four (4) to two (2) to approve the Water and Sewer Budget on first reading without the 4.2% rate increase and to direct staff to bring back a budget that reflects cuts on the water side of the budget at the next meeting. Voting aye were Mr. Davis, Mr. Baddourah, Mr. Duvall and Mr. McDowell. Voting nay were Ms. Devine and Mayor Benjamin.

Councilor McDowell complimented staff on the new arrangements in Chambers. He said this is a wonderful benefit; I could see my colleagues and hear every word spoken.

### **CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS/REFERRALS**

*No reports or referrals were made at this time.*

### **APPEARANCE OF THE PUBLIC**

Mr. Temple Ligon said we are becoming the speed hump capitol of the world and we still don't know what we're doing.

**EXECUTIVE SESSION** – *City Council did not meet in Executive Session.*

43. Receipt of legal advice which relates to matters covered by the attorney-client privilege – *S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)*
  - *Smoke-free Medical District*
44. Discussion of negotiations incident to proposed contractual arrangements - *S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)*
  - *Sewer Service Area*
  - *Affordable Childcare*
45. Discussion of matters relating to the proposed location, expansion, or the provision of services encouraging location or expansion of industries or other businesses in the area served by the public body - *S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(5)*
  - *Vista Studios*
46. Discussion of employment of an employee – *S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to adjourn the meeting at 9:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by:

Erika D. Moore  
City Clerk