



The Columbia City Council conducted a Meeting on Tuesday, June 17, 2014 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina. The Honorable Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 6:17 p.m. The following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, The Honorable Leona K. Plaugh, The Honorable Brian DeQuincey Newman, The Honorable Cameron A. Runyan and The Honorable Moe Baddourah. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. *The minutes are numbered to coincide with the order of the meeting.*

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

INVOCATION

Mr. Aubrey Jenkins, Fire Chief for the Columbia Fire Department offered the invocation.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to adopt the agenda, subject to deferring consideration of **Item 1** (*Approval of the Minutes*) and **Item 26** (*Exclusive Minor Child Play Zones*).

PUBLIC INPUT RELATED TO AGENDA ITEMS

No one appeared at this time.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. Meeting Minutes of [January 7, 2014 Work Session and Council Meeting](#), and [February 4, 2014 Work Session](#) – *Consideration of this item was deferred.*

PRESENTATIONS

2. [Recognition of Richland School District One Gates Millennium Scholars](#)
– The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin

Mayor Benjamin recognized Jaleel Jefferson of Dreher High School and Samanuel Martin of W.J. Keenan High School for being named as 2014 Gates Millennium Scholars, a highly prestigious award that will pay the entire cost up to \$1 million of their college education, including graduate school. Jaleel plans to pursue a degree in neuroscience with the goal of obtaining a Ph.D. in neuroscience research and a medical degree. His grandmother has Alzheimer's disease and he is motivated to find a cure by conducting research on the brain and treating patients with this disease. In addition to being the battalion commander of Keenan's Army JROTC program, Samanuel is a member of Project REAL, Keenan's engineering program and the robotics team. He plans to obtain a degree in biomedical engineering with the long-range goal of using his knowledge to design better prostheses.

Master Jaleel Jefferson thanked the Mayor and members of Council for acknowledging their achievements. He announced that he will be attending the University of South Carolina's Honors College where he will major in Cognitive Neuroscience.

Master Samanuel Martin also thanked the Mayor and members of Council for the recognition. He announced that he will be attending North Carolina State University.

**Mayor Benjamin announced that Council will not be taking up the Hospitality Tax and Accommodations Tax budgets tonight.

3. The City Manager's Employee Recognition Program: City LIGHTs – Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager explained that on a daily basis she deals with many constituent concerns that are oftentimes unpleasant. She recently had a pleasant and rewarding conversation with a citizen that reminded her that our employees are about the values, mission and the vision of the City of Columbia. She said there are employees that are about doing the right thing when nobody is watching. She announced a new program called City LIGHTs, which will be a platform for recognizing employees who engage in random acts of kindness, go above and beyond the call of duty to help those in need or exceed expectations as an ambassador for the City of Columbia. She explained that LIGHT is an acronym that represents the following values of the program: Leadership, Integrity, Generosity, having a Helpful attitude and sharing their Talent to help others or benefit the community. She said there is a light in all of us that only we can dim. She inducted Allen Donnell Etheredge, Maintenance Technician II for

the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant and Matthew Derrick Gunning, Utility Worker II for the Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant into the City LIGHTs Program. She presented these gentlemen with certificates of recognition and pins in honor of being inducted into the City LIGHTs Program. She encouraged them to shine on!

Mr. Chip Sharp said that these employees keep the basic services rolling, but they do more than that. He recalled when he was recently rear-ended by another vehicle wherein the other driver was about to go into a diabetic shock. He said these two city employees helped him manage the situation even though they weren't first responders. He referred to them as great people that make citizens enjoy living in the City of Columbia.

4. 2014 Preservation and Renovation Award for Council Chambers – Ms. Robin Waites, Executive Director of the Historic Columbia Foundation

Ms. Robin Waites, Executive Director of the Historic Columbia Foundation presented the 2014 Preservation and Renovation Award to the City of Columbia for Council Chambers. On May 8, 2014 six (6) projects were recognized to include the Brennen Building, the Reeder House, the Seegers-Habenicht Building and the Booker T. Washington Auditorium. She recalled that this building was erected in 1873 as a post office and a federal courthouse. She said this was one of the signature buildings erected during the Reconstruction Era in Columbia. She recalled that in 1932, Mayor L.B. Owens and City Council negotiated the swap of the then vacant lot at the corner of Laurel Street and Assembly Street and 1737 Main Street has served as the location for City Hall since that time. She said that by investing over \$1 million in this local landmark and national register listed structure, the City has shown its commitment to preservation and to the revitalization of Columbia's Main Street.

5. [National Homeownership Month Proclamation](#) – Ms. Deborah Livingston, Director of Community Development
 - Partner In Excellence Award Recipients
 - [Ownership, Maintaining and Gardening \(OMG\) of Homeownership Workshop](#)

Ms. Deborah Livingston, Director of Community Development announced that this is the 40th Anniversary of the Community Development Block Grant and on May 4, 2015, we will celebrate the 40th anniversary of the Community Development Department. She distributed copies of the Community Development Action Plan, noting that the plan has not been approved by the Department of Housing and Urban Development.

Mr. Jeff Rainwater, Community Liaison for the Community Development Department announced that the 3rd Annual Ownership, Maintaining and Gardening (OMG) of Homeownership Workshop will be held on Saturday, June 21, 2014 at the Midlands Technical College Northeast Campus. He explained that the event is about helping people understand housing related issues. He recognized two (2) of the sponsors as Partners in Excellence: South Carolina Bank & Trust and Home Depot.

Mayor Benjamin and the members of Council proclaimed June 2014 as Homeownership Month in the City of Columbia. Proclamations were presented to Mr. Montague Laffitte, Central Regional President and Mr. Nate Barber, Senior Vice President & CRA Officer for South Carolina Bank & Trust and Mr. Bob Whitworth, Manager of the Two Notch Road Home Depot.

Mr. Montague Laffitte, Central Regional President South Carolina Bank & Trust said they like to promote and encourage homeownership, especially in the city; it makes us a better place and a better community. He said they appreciate the partnership with the City of Columbia and they look forward to a successful event on Saturday.

Mr. Bob Whitworth, Manager of the Two Notch Road Home Depot thanked the Community Development Department for the partnership. He said the message is sent to them clearly by their leaders to make an emotional connection with the community.

Mr. Jeff Rainwater, Community Liaison for the Community Development Department recognized the following Employees in Excellence for their support: Ms. Amy Wright of the Forestry and Beautification Department; Mr. Barry Wells of the Parks and Recreation Department; Ms. Winter Odom of the Police Department; Ms. Samantha Yager of the Public Relations Department; and Mr. Dave Williamson of the Information Technology Department.

6. [Update from Capital City Lake Murray Country](#) – Ms. Miriam Atria, President / Chief Executive Officer of Capital City Lake Murray Country

Ms. Miriam Atria, President / Chief Executive Officer of Capital City Lake Murray Country asked Council to accept the Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee's recommendations for funding the two (2) marketing agencies: the Conventions and Visitors Bureau and Capital City Lake Murray Country. She reported that since 1981, Capital City Lake Murray Country has been dedicated to promoting tourism and the outdoor recreation offered by our four county region. She said that the organization dedicates 50% of its budget for direct marketing and advertising. She reported that 76,937 hunting and fishing licenses were sold and 50,459 boats/motors were titled in the four counties during 2013. She announced that they just booked the Motor Coach Association's regional meeting, which will bring in 350 motor coach and tour operators and they

booked the first Richland Golf Invitational. Ms. Atria continued to report on the new business and returning business to include the 2015 National Collegiate Fishing Championship and the Forrest Wood Cup. She said in marketing you must be consistent; you must stay on message; you must fish when they are fishing; and you better fish where the fish are!

Councilor Davis said we received worldwide coverage on the Forrest Woods Cup and the golf tournament will create a big boom for the area as well. He is very happy to see the Conventions and Visitors Bureau and Capital City Lake Murray Country working together as a team this year.

Mr. Bill Ellen, Executive Director of the Conventions and Visitors Bureau thanked City Council for their continued support. He said they are trying new things to attract new business that will make a positive economic impact on tourism, meetings and conventions. He said they recently completed two (2) sales trips in Charlotte and Atlanta to visit with qualified meeting planners. He said they took hotel sales representatives and information on local attractions with them. He reported that over twenty (20) meeting planners attended the luncheons wherein they presented a package of the region; there was tremendous feedback from the attendees. He reported that the future expectation of visitors to the Convention Center is up 34%.

OTHER MATTERS

7. [Neighborhood Street Lighting Request](#) - *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. Newman, Council voted unanimously to approve the following Neighborhood Street Lighting request:

Neighborhoods Listed by Priority	Existing Lights	Requested Lights	Current Lease Cost / Annually	Project Request Total	Total Year to Date
2109 Shealy Street	2	1	\$237.84	\$118.92	\$18,075.64

8. [Fiscal Year 2014 / 2015 Edward Byrne Memorial Justice Assistance Grant Program Application](#) - *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Newman, Council voted unanimously to approve the submission of the Fiscal Year 2014 / 2015 Edward Byrne Memorial Justice Assistance Grant Program Application by the Columbia Police Department.

CONSENT AGENDA

Upon a single motion made by Mr. Runyan and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve the **Consent Agenda Items 9** through **23**.

CONSIDERATION OF BIDS and AGREEMENTS

9. Council is asked to approve [Project PK001203; Removal of Asbestos at the Woodland Park Tennis Courts](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to ARM Environmental Services, Inc., the lowest bidder in the amount of \$54,450.00. This vendor is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Capital Projects Fund-Parks and Recreation; 4039999-PK001203-658660 – **Note:** The original budgeted amount for this project is \$60,000.00. – Approved*
10. Council is asked to approve [Change Order #1 for Project CP107101; Virginia Pack Elementary School Demolition](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to Complete Demolition Services, LLC in the amount of \$54,756.00. This vendor is located in Carrollton, GA. *The original contract amount was \$142,000 and the additional funding needed will be provided from the originally approved budget. – **Note:** This project was initiated by the City and additional work is needed to complete asbestos abatement prior to the demolition. This change order extends the contract completion date to July 8, 2014. The original budgeted amount for this project is \$300,000.00. – Approved*
11. Council is asked to approve a [Contract for Elevator Maintenance Services](#), as requested by the Support Services Division. Award to Southern Elevator, the lowest responsible and responsive bidder in the amount of \$62,400.00. This vendor is located in West Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: General Support Services/Maintenance and Service Contracts; 1011201-638200 – **Note:** The original budgeted amount for this service is \$80,400.00. – Approved*
12. Council is asked to approve the [Purchase of a License Plate Recognition System Database](#), as requested by the Police Department. Award to NDI Technologies, Inc., in the amount of \$109,042.36. This vendor is located in Charlotte, NC. *Funding Source: Police Administrative Services/Computer Equipment/Hardware; 1012402-627500 – **Note:** NDI Recognition System is the sole provider of the automatic license plate reader. It interfaces with the South Carolina Law Enforcement Division (SLED) existing Vehicle Intelligence Server and Communications Engine and will allow the Columbia Police Department to participate with sharing applications and tools. The original budgeted amount for this purchase is \$110,826.36.- Approved*

13. Council is asked to approve the [Contracting of Video Security Services](#), as requested by the Purchasing Department. Award to Statewide Security Systems, Inc., the responsive and responsible bidder in the amount of \$616,500. This vendor is located in Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Hospitality Funds (\$100,000) and General Funds (\$575,000) – **Note:** The initial term of the agreement shall be for three (3) years with the option to extend for an additional two (2) one-year periods. – Approved*
14. Council is asked to approve [Project WM4000; Water Main Construction at Lake Katherine](#) Phase I, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to Carolina Tap and Bore, the lowest responsive and responsible bidder in the amount of \$2,374,485.00 with a project reduce contingency of \$178,665.00 for a total amount of \$2,553,150.00. This vendor is located in West Columbia, SC. *Funding Source: Water Improvement Fund; 5529999-WM400001-658650 – **Note:** This is a Mentor Protégé Program Project and Northeast Backflow (Protégé) located in Lugoff, SC is implementing 20% (\$525,000) of the contract value. The original budgeted amount for this project is \$2,553,150.00. – Approved*
15. Council is asked to [Project SS6966-12; Contract for Annual Construction Services for Sanitary Sewer Pipe Rehabilitation](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to Inland Pipe Rehabilitation in the amount of \$3,000,000.00. This firm is located in Knoxville, TN. *Funding Source: Sanitary Sewer Operating Budget 5516205-SS708804-638505 – **Note:** Inland Pipe Rehabilitation has an office in Gilbert, SC. – Approved*
16. Council is asked to approve [Project SS7208; Rehabilitation of Saluda River Basins Three, Ten and Twelve](#), as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to McClam and Associates, the lowest responsive and responsible bidder in the amount of \$5,922,527.00. This vendor is located in Little Mountain, SC. *Funding and Supplement Source: Sewer Improvement Fund; 5529999-658650-SS720801 – **Note:** This is a Mentor Protégé Program Project and Herdon, Inc., (Protégé) located in Lugoff, SC is implementing 23% (\$1,359,050) of the contract value. The original budgeted amount for this project is \$4,000,000. Supplemental Funding is provided through the remaining approved funds in projects SS_Misc (\$504,161) and SS7218 (\$1,418,366). – Approved*

ORDINANCES – SECOND READING

17. [Ordinance No.: 2014-034](#) – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 3, Advertising to repeal Sec. 3-2 Approval of signs and renumber subsequent sections – **Note:** *Municode recommended that we repeal these provisions as signs are now regulated under Chapter 17, Article III, Division 12 – First reading approval was given on June 10, 2014. – Approved on second reading.*
18. [Ordinance No.: 2014-060](#) – Granting an encroachment to Good Life Café at 1614 Main Street for placement and maintenance of eight (8) wrought iron chairs and four (4) square wrought iron tables within the right of way area of the 1600 block of Main Street immediately adjacent to their building; placement and maintenance of two (2) wrought iron chairs and one (1) square wrought iron table between the curbed garden area adjacent to the parking meters immediately in front of their business; and placement and maintenance of twenty-five (25) wrought iron chairs and thirteen (13) square wrought iron tables along the southern right of way area of the alleyway adjacent to their building at 1614 Main Street for use by its patrons for outdoor dining during its normal business hours – *First reading approval was given on June 10, 2014. – Approved on second reading.*
19. [Ordinance No.: 2014-061](#) – Granting an encroachment to Michael's at 1624 Main Street for placement and maintenance of twenty (20) wrought iron tables and ten (10) wrought iron chairs within the sidewalk right of way area of the 1600 block of Main Street immediately adjacent to their building; placement and maintenance of twenty-four (24) wrought iron chairs and twelve (12) wrought iron tables along the northern right of way area of the alleyway adjacent to their building at 1624 Main Street for use by its patrons for outdoor dining during its normal business – *First reading approval was given on June 10, 2014. – Approved on second reading.*
20. [Ordinance No.: 2014-062](#) – Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Quit Claim Deed from the City of Columbia to Harold Howard and Michelle Branch-Howard for an approximately 534 square foot portion of the Barhamville Estates Storm Drainage Channel, Richland County TMS#11507-03-35 (portion); CF#36-15A – **Note:** *The owners have built an addition to their home that encroaches onto the City's property. The Department of Utilities and Engineering has performed a field inspection of the encroachment area and have determined that there are no conflicts. The agreement was created, because the proximity of the structure was built next to the existing storm drainage pipe. – First reading approval was given on June 10, 2014. – Approved on second reading.*

21. [Ordinance No.: 2014-067](#) – Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Contract of Sale and any other documents necessary to consummate the transfer of 2111 Georgia Elam Lane, Richland County TMS #11506-10-73 from the City of Columbia to Le'Shunn D. White, Sr. – *First reading approval was given on June 10, 2014. – Approved on second reading.*
22. [Ordinance No.: 2014-069](#) – Granting an encroachment to Off Menu Ltd d/b/a Bourbon at 1214 Main Street for placement and maintenance of sixteen(16) chairs and three (3) tables within the right of way are of the 1200 block of Main Street immediately adjacent to their building; placement and maintenance of twelve (12) chairs and three (3) table adjacent to the parking meters immediately in front of their business at 1214 Main Street for use by its patrons for outdoor dining during its normal business hours – *First reading approval was given on June 10, 2014. – Approved on second reading.*
23. [Ordinance No.: 2014-070](#) – Granting an encroachment to Agape Pharmacy, Inc. at 1626 Main Street for the placement and maintenance of two (2) circular planters within the right of way area of the 1600 block of Main Street immediately adjacent to their building – *First reading approval was given on June 10, 2014. – Approved on second reading.*

ORDINANCES – SECOND READING

24. [Ordinance No.: 2014-038](#) – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 15, Parks and Recreation, Sec. 15-1 Prohibited acts in parks to add (14) Exclusive minor child play zones – *First reading approval was given on May 20, 2014 by a vote of five (5) to two (2). Consideration of this item was deferred on June 17, 2014.*

ORDINANCES – FIRST READING

25. [Ordinance No.: 2014-049](#) – Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Multi-Use Venue Development Agreement between the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Hardball Capital, LLC and Bull Street Development, LLC – *Approved on first reading by a vote of five (5) to two (2).* - [Click here to view the presentation.](#)

Ms. Melissa Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations provided an overview of the Venue Development Agreement, which covers the process of designing and constructing the multi-use venue. She said that Council will be asked to give first reading approval to the Hospitality Bond Ordinance on June 24, 2014; a contract to secure architectural services will be presented on July 15, 2014; and a Request for Information for parking partners will be released in July.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer presented the hospitality bond schedule with a projected closing date of early September 2014.

Ms. Jeanne Brooker, Esq., Assistant City Attorney reviewed the timelines for the project under the venue development agreement with a projected construction commencement date of October 1, 2014 and a completion date of June 1, 2016. She presented the deal points under the Venue Development Agreement, which terminates upon final completion of the venue with the exception of a few provisions. She noted that there will be a plaza, which is essentially the entryway into the stadium. She explained that the plaza will be managed by the club during venue events; otherwise it is available for use by the city and the Bull Street development.

Councilor Devine asked if the Bull Street Design Review Committee would approve the architecture of the venue.

Ms. Jeanne Brooker, Esq., Assistant City Attorney said it is subject to the PUD and the Bull Street Design Review Committee.

Councilor Newman made a motion to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2014-049 – Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Multi-Use Venue Development Agreement between the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Hardball Capital, LLC and Bull Street Development, LLC. Councilor Davis seconded the motion.

Councilor Plaugh said that she is not an advocate of building the entertainment venue. She said that staff reviewed the document with her and they did yeoman's work in trying to make this the best document we can have. She remains concerned about the parking responsibilities and liabilities that are established by the Venue License Agreement and the Venue Development Agreement. She understands that some deletions will be made as it relates to how we deal with excess bond proceeds. She said staff has done a good job making sure we are able to get a preliminary survey for soil testing and other tests. She hopes that staff will continue to work on the penalty provision and narrow down the city's liability during construction. She expressed concerns about how the money flows through the deal. She would prefer that we have a pro-rata exposure of monies going towards this project.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Newman and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted five (5) to two (2) to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2014-049 – Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Multi-Use Venue Development Agreement between the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Hardball Capital, LLC and Bull Street Development, LLC. Voting aye were Mr. Runyan, Mr. Newman, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Voting nay were Mr. Baddourah and Ms. Plaugh.

Councilor Davis said he looked at this and he agrees that staff has positioned us to move forward by doing their due diligence on behalf of the city. He recalled his concerns regarding the owner and developer's participation and that the \$6 million shows up as cash in the deal. He said that is one thing we will continue to monitor to ensure that the developer's input is no less than \$6 million towards this deal.

RESOLUTIONS

26. [Resolution No.: R-2014-026](#) – Authorizing consumption of beer and wine only at the Main Street Latin Festival - *This event is scheduled for Saturday, August 23, 2014. - Approved*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Newman and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2014-026 – Authorizing consumption of beer and wine only at the Main Street Latin Festival. Mayor Benjamin was not present for the vote.

27. [Resolution No.: R-2014-055](#) – Authorizing execution of a First Renewal of the Service Agreement for Third Party Administration of the City of Columbia's Self-Insured Tort Program with Companion Third Party Administrative Services, LLC - *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2014-055 – Authorizing execution of a First Renewal of the Service Agreement for Third Party Administration of the City of Columbia's Self-Insured Tort Program with Companion Third Party Administrative Services, LLC. Mayor Benjamin was not present for the vote.

28. [Resolution No.: R-2014-056](#) – Authorizing execution of a First Renewal of the Service Agreement for Third Party Administration of the City of Columbia's Self-Insured Workers' Compensation Program with Companion Third Party Administrative Services, LLC - *Approved*

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Runyan, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2014-056 – Authorizing execution of a First Renewal of the Service Agreement for Third Party Administration of the City of Columbia's Self-Insured Workers' Compensation Program with Companion Third Party Administrative Services, LLC. Mayor Benjamin was not present for the vote.

APPOINTMENTS

29. [Climate Protection Action Committee](#)

Upon a motion made by Mr. Runyan and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Mr. Hance Jones to the Climate Protection Action Committee to complete Dr. Bruce Coull's term ending on March 31, 2016. Mayor Benjamin was not present for the vote.

30. [Greater Columbia Community Relations Council](#)

Upon a motion made by Mr. Runyan and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve the appointment of Ms. Ray Borders Gray to the Greater Columbia Community Relations Council to complete Ms. Beth Inman's term ending on June 30, 2016. Mayor Benjamin was not present for the vote.

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS/REFERRALS

31. Council is asked to refer a presentation of a coating product for the sewer system to the Environment and Infrastructure Committee, as requested by The Honorable Cameron A. Runyan. *This product has the potential for short and long-term cost savings to the system and ratepayers.*

Upon a motion made by Mr. Runyan and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to refer a presentation of a coating product for the sewer system to the Environment and Infrastructure Committee. Mayor Benjamin was not present for the vote.

32. **Council is asked to refer a discussion of criteria for line items in the hospitality tax budget.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to refer the discussion of conditions for line items in the hospitality tax budget to the Arts and Historic Preservation Committee. Mayor Benjamin was not present for the vote.

**Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve the possession and/or consumption of alcoholic beverages, beer or wine at the Earlewood Park Community Building during private events.

BUDGET ORDINANCES – FIRST READING

33. [Ordinance No.: 2014-056](#) – To Raise Revenue and Adopt the Budget for the City of Columbia, South Carolina, or the Fiscal Year ending June 30, 2015 – *The Public Hearing was held on June 10, 2014. - Approved on first reading by a vote of five (5) to two (2).*

Mayor Benjamin said we have a good budget; there's some moving around inside the budget that he'd like to propose; he would like to find some latitude while recognizing that the general fund budget amount will have to remain steady; and the less we transfer from the hospitality tax fund to the general fund, the more we will have to work with.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director provided an overview of the Fiscal Year 2014/2015 budget, which doesn't include a property tax increase. The proposed general fund budget is \$127,894,947 with revenues of \$111,029,947 and transfers-in at \$16,865,000. She noted that 42% of the budget goes to Public Safety. She reviewed the proposed General Fund expenditures by the following strategic plan focus areas: public safety, economic and community development, environment and infrastructure, and communications and customer services. She reviewed the non-departmental items that are budgeted in the total amount of \$3,010,817 and transfers-out at \$15,571,973.

Councilor Plaugh asked if there are more than two (2) contingency funds.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director said no; there's a special emergency reserve in the amount of \$250,000 and a City Council Contingency Fund in the amount of \$75,000.

Councilor Plaugh reiterated her request for a breakout of the Mayor's Office budget and City Council's budget.

Councilor Baddourah asked about the 22% increase in Public Relation's budget.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director said that's for the additional position and web streaming of meetings and other technical services related with Channel 2.

Mayor Benjamin acknowledged that there are more special projects and events, but that may not be the best place to spend the money. He noted that staff was directed to trim recommendations in the original budget that was presented; a number of important items were trimmed and he wants to bring some of those back up and propose reductions in the priorities as articulated. He recommended that the following adjustments be made to the budget: **(1)** Reduce the 2% Cost of Living Adjustment to 1%. He noted that we will have increased healthcare costs in the spring and we want to be sensitive of that fact. He said this will reduce the

overall expenditure to \$500,000. He noted that we are also looking at the implementation of the compensation and classification study and at the City Manager's recommendation we will decide how to handle that later; (2) Remove the additional special projects position from the Public Relations Department; (3) Replace the General Fund 2013 fund balance allocation for Finlay Park in the amount of \$310,000 with \$310,000 allocated for Southeast Park in the 2003 Hospitality Tax Bond leaving \$492,000 for Southeast Park; (4) Use \$160,000 of the \$310,000 General Fund 2013 fund balance allocation for Finlay Park to fund Hyatt Park for a total amount of \$500,000; (5) He sought the City Manager's recommendation on how to fund an annexation coordinator position in the amount of \$85,000 for salary and fringe benefits. He said it is important for us to deliberately grow; as a state, we have the most archaic annexation policies in the country; and we need one person who is dedicated to that every single day.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager clarified that some of the other contractual items for the Public Relations Department are necessary. She asked if the recommendation included those items.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director noted that \$60,000 was allocated for the position to include fringe benefits.

Mayor Benjamin clarified that the recommendation only included the position. He continued to outline his recommended adjustments to the budget: (6) He would like to add \$50,000 back to the Youth Sports Initiative for a total of \$150,000.

Councilor Plough asked if this is in addition to the \$273,000 that is being allocated for a youth crime prevention initiative.

Mayor Benjamin said yes. He continued to say that it is bone chilling to think that there are senior citizens who have given their entire lives to this city who are going hungry. He recommended funding for Senior Resources in the amount of \$35,670.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked if this would come out of the Community Promotions funding.

Mayor Benjamin said they can determine later tonight where best to fund it from. (7) He continued to recommend funding in the amount of \$45,000 for Sustainable Midlands to fund a staff position for a Watershed Coordinator.

Councilor Devine asked if the Watershed Coordinator would coordinate the plans for all of the watersheds.

Councilor Plough asked if that position is going to be in Sustainable Midlands; is it the Executive Director.

Mayor Benjamin said no; it will be a staff person who reports to the Executive Director. He explained that Richland County has appropriated funding for the South Assembly Street joint master plan and that funding was contingent upon the city providing match funds.

Councilor Devine confirmed that Richland County has funded their portion of the project and it was specifically contingent upon our funding.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director reported that Krista Hampton, Director of Planning and Development Services was able to include that in her budget at \$75,000.

Councilor Devine requested funding for **(8)** Columbia Opportunities Resource (COR) in the amount of \$50,000. She explained that COR keeps our young professionals engaged. She recalled that in the past the Chamber requested \$100,000 and the city specified that \$50,000 of that \$100,000 go to COR. She noted that she isn't requesting funding for the Good to Great Foundation. She sought consideration of funding COR directly.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said this is being considered for funding through the Economic Development Department.

Mayor Benjamin confirmed that the Watershed Coordinator is for Smith's Branch and Rocky Branch.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we would only be dealing with 2014/2015.

Councilor Devine said that Gills Creek has its own organization. She suggested that they ask if there is interest in including Gills Creek.

Councilor Plaugh asked where this would be funded from.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager sought clarification of the request from Sustainable Midlands.

Councilor Devine explained that the Watershed Coordinator would assist the city in meeting its MS4 requirements.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said she feels confident with city staff, but we will look at this if it is something this Council wants us to consider.

Mayor Benjamin recommended funding for **(9)** an updated Disparity Study.

Councilor Newman explained that we've had conversations with the County regarding a joint disparity study. He said they've already passed their budget and there would be a \$25,000 cost savings if we did a joint study. He said we haven't made significant traction since we last discussed the procurement policies. He said since we have so many major projects and procurements coming up, it is important to set aside \$250,000 now. He noted that it is also important to this community that we identify all of our potential vendors and ensure that we are equitably expending public funds.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said she doesn't see how we would get to the Disparity Study this year, because it would require a lot of staff time. She said we didn't have clarity as to whether or not the county is moving forward. She is hopeful that the study will be reflective of our efforts over the next year.

Ms. Tina Herbert, Executive Director of the Office of Business Opportunities said it will cost \$250,000 exclusive of legal fees if we do it by ourselves, but if we do it with the county it will be \$225,000. She will confirm whether or not the county budgeted for it.

Councilor Devine suggested that we allocate funding contingent upon Richland County allocating funding for the study. She said there is a lot of value in doing this regionally, but it's not a wise investment if it can't be done this year.

Mayor Benjamin agreed to defer consideration of the allocation for a Disparity Study for now. He said several requests are hospitality tax related, but he will defer to staff on how we meet these standing requests. He said this leads into the overall philosophical discussion about most of us wanting to see less being transferred into the General Fund and more being dedicated specifically for arts organizations. He continued to outline his recommendations: **(10)** a pending request for funding from the North Columbia Business Association in the amount of \$90,000 to be treated just as the Vista Guild, Five Points and the City Center Partnership; **(11)** an ongoing request from the State Museum in the amount of \$100,000 to launch its brand new opening; **(12)** a request from the Vista Guild for a public private match in the amount of \$150,000 for Yellow Shirts. He noted that they have over \$100,000; **(13)** the Columbia Museum of Art requested a 3% increase of \$20,857, which is their first increase in some time; **(14)** He recalled that the city made a financial commitment several years ago to the Renaissance Foundation, which we framed as a backstop as they pursued a tax credit allocation. He said he met with the Renaissance Foundation and Richland County and the request is for a 10-year commitment in the amount of \$75,000. He noted that this is a \$25,000 increase over the current allocation; **(15)** Fund Nickelodeon in the amount of \$110,000 at a 5-year commitment; **(16)** Fund the Columbia International Festival an additional \$25,000 for a total of \$75,000; **(17)** Use the remaining \$150,000 that was freed up in the General Fund 2013 fund balance to purchase new vehicles for the Columbia Police Department.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said that the North Columbia Business Association is ineligible for hospitality tax funding and she clarified that Senior Resources is funded from the Community Development Block Grant in the amount of \$43,297.50 for fiscal year 2014/2015.

Mayor Benjamin said the request for \$35,670 for Senior Resources is in addition to the CDBG funding.

- **Council recessed at 8:30 p.m.**

- **Council reconvened at 8:44 p.m.**

Mr. Jeff Palen, Chief Financial Officer reviewed the changes that were made to the budgets. He explained that if we reduce the transfer to the General Fund from the Hospitality Tax Fund, we will have a shortfall of \$141,527. He noted that the changes to the General Capital Fund have a net effect of zero.

Mayor Benjamin said it has been determined that \$130,000 is in the budget for the Youth Sports Initiative. He recommended that the proposed additional \$50,000 be allocated to the Office of Economic Development with no strings attached.

Councilor Devine rescinded the request for \$50,000 for COR since the money is already in the Economic Development budget. She asked that staff understand Council's desire for COR to receive \$50,000.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager noted that those are water and sewer funds and until the final changes are made, it may be best to leave the allocation to COR as is. She suggested that it might be funded 50% from Water and Sewer and 50% from the General Fund.

Councilor Devine said she supports most of the allocations, but she is concerned that we are continuing our practice of allocating money without looking at the big picture and prioritizing what's important to us. She would like to support City Year in the amount of \$10,000 and the Midlands Housing Trust Fund.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said the agreement with the Midlands Housing Trust Fund allowed them to have a rolling allocation from our housing loan dollars. She said it allowed the money to roll over if they didn't use it. She thought the intent was to always keep the level of funding at \$100,000 each year to include the rollover amount.

Councilor Devine said she's not sure if that's the organization's understanding.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we don't have an agreement with the Midlands Housing Taskforce for more than \$100,000. She noted that they've used \$40,000 of their \$100,000 allocation from the HOME Fund this year. She sought Council's clarification as to whether or not the organization should receive \$100,000 each year.

Councilor Devine said with limited funds, we need to have a plan on how to address other funding requests and be cautious of running the risk of falling back into the practice of funding people at different meetings. She reiterated the request to fund City Year at \$10,000 from the Hospitality Tax Fund.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager reiterated the proposal to fund the Community Promotions Fund in the amount of \$75,000.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director recalled that \$72,000 is available in the Accommodations Tax Fund for general purpose use. She noted that City Year was previously funded from this allocation.

Councilor Devine also noted that EdVenture and the Classical Ballet have requests for additional funding. She agreed to wait to fund City Year. She urged everyone to be cognizant of how we spend the 5% in Accommodations Tax funds for general use, especially since we no longer have a Community Promotions Fund. She asked to set a date certain to consider the other funding requests.

Mayor Benjamin clarified that these were changes to a budget that already aggressively addressed our public safety needs; police cars; a new burn building for the Fire Department; important public private partnerships; and a number of significant items that address capital improvements, parks, historic preservation, and the arts. He is excited about what the budget is going to produce for the people of the City of Columbia.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director recommended on behalf of the Chief Financial Officer that the deficit in the amount of \$141,527 be funded from the \$250,000 budgeted reserves.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked if Council wanted to move forward with an internal auditor with the \$75,000 Council Contingency.

Mayor Benjamin said yes.

Councilor Baddourah said we are taking \$500,000 from employee raises and redirecting it.

Mayor Benjamin noted that this will be the third consecutive Cost of Living Adjustment.

Councilor Baddourah asked where funding would come from for healthcare costs if the Defined Dollar Benefit (DDB) is increased.

Mayor Benjamin said a number of ideas have been presented, but one proposal is to increase the amount of the benefit from \$800 to \$1,000, but he is unsure what that would add to our Annual Required Contribution. He said we have to decrease our long-term liability. He said increasing the DDB is the wrong direction to go in and he's not sure where the money is coming from.

Councilor Baddourah asked if there will be a presentation on the CIP and Water and Sewer budgets tonight. He said we are taking money from the storm drainage budget for Bull Street; it is the money that customers pay every month and we are taking it out of their neighborhoods to put it in Bull Street. He said it is the same thing with the Water and Sewer allocation going to Bull Street, which takes away from regular CIP projects in the city. He is having a hard time with this.

Councilor Plough asked that they vote on the funds individually and that the CIP for water and sewer be shown to the public. She said Council didn't want to do a rate increase and staff had to cut a \$100 million budget back to \$40 million. She asked that this information be shown to the public.

Councilor Devine said that Mr. Baddourah raised a valid concern about the COLA. She said we are undertaking a comprehensive compensation and classification study and we must be able to fund that and some adjustments may be more than a 2% increase. She said we are trying to equitably compensate them for the good work they do.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director reported that the water and wastewater capital improvement plan includes \$24,300,000 for sewer capital projects and \$15,900,000 for water capital projects for a total amount of \$40,200,000.

A motion was made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Runyan, to approve the Water and Sewer Fund Budget without the Capital Improvement Program.

Councilor Plough said she is concerned that we reduced our transfer out of the Water and Sewer Fund and into the General Fund and at the same time we increased expenses for positions that aren't related to the Water and Sewer Fund. She said there is no savings. She is concerned that staff can't complete projects for the amount of funding allocated. She said there is a philosophical difference on the CIPS for storm water and water and sewer. She asked do you spend the money on the most pressing project needs or do you put Bull Street at the same level of importance as those EPA projects. She said several million dollars are being taken away from other priority projects.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Runyan, Council voted five (5) to two (2) to approve the budget for the Water and Sewer Fund, excluding the capital projects. Voting aye were Mr. Runyan, Mr. Newman, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Voting nay were Mr. Baddourah and Ms. Plough.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Newman and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to approve the budget for the Storm Water Operating Fund, excluding the Capital Projects.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Newman and seconded by Mr. Runyan, Council voted five (5) to two (2) to approve the budget for the Storm Water Capital Projects. Voting aye were Mr. Runyan, Mr. Newman, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Voting nay were Mr. Baddourah and Ms. Plough.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Newman, Council voted five (5) to two (2) to approve the budget for the Water and Sewer Capital Projects. Voting aye were Mr. Runyan, Mr. Newman, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Voting nay were Mr. Baddourah and Ms. Plough.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Runyan and seconded by Mr. Newman, Council voted unanimously to approve the budget for the Parking Fund.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Newman and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted six (6) to one (1) to approve the budget for the Hospitality Tax Fund, as amended. Voting aye were Mr. Baddourah, Mr. Runyan, Mr. Newman, Ms. Plough, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Ms. Devine voted nay.

Hospitality Tax

Budget Reductions

Transfer to General Fund	430,857
--------------------------	----------------

Budget Additions

Columbia International Festival*	25,000
Vista Guild*	150,000
Columbia Museum of Art	20,857
State Museum	100,000
Nickelodeon - 5 year commitment	110,000
Renaissance - 10 year commitment contingent upon award of New Market Tax Credits - total allocation is \$75,000	25,000
Total Additions	430,857

**Allocations are increases to Hospitality Tax Committee recommended funding.
Unless otherwise noted, allocations are for FY 14/15 only.*

Councilor Devine reiterated concerns about making piecemeal allocations.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Runyan and seconded by Mr. Newman, Council voted unanimously to approve the budget for the Accommodations Tax Fund.

Councilor Plough expressed concerns about the General Fund being a deficit budget; we are planning to spend more money than we are taking in. She said we need approach this from a good public policy perspective. She asked that Council discuss this at the retreat. She said we have fourteen (14) new positions and she is not sure that we are looking at efficiencies.

Councilor Runyan said the General Fund budget is one of the most important budgets; it is a critical fund for the city. He said there are a lot of good things in the budget, such as increased funding to public safety and our parks. He has a concern that will prevent him from being able to support this budget. He said if you are going to end transfers, you have to account for what you're going to reduce. He said the Budget Committee attempted to get to a zero spending increase budget. He said every time we add another employee, we are incurring a long-term reoccurring liability. He said we have employees that retire in their early fifties and we could have a long-term liability that outlasts their actual tenure with the city. He will be bringing requests to the Budget Committee for this Council to look at private sector collaboration on certain activities that we perform as a City. He said we need to think out of the box on some issues; have public discussions about them; and decide if we are able to collaborate with the private sector to reduce our overall costs of running this city and reduce our overall long-term liability associated with employees, but at the same time protect the delivery and quality of services. He acknowledged that this will be a difficult discussion, but we must have the discussion. He thanked staff for their hard work on the budget. He hopes to start budget discussions in August.

Councilor Baddourah agreed that there are a lot of good aspects in the General Fund budget to include the additional funding for the Police Department. He questioned the use of GO Bond proceeds; he thought we weren't using that.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director said we will be using a capital lease purchase next year.

Councilor Baddourah asked about the collection of water and sewer bills. He asked if we are losing money on that bad debt. He asked if we need to look at ways to collect our money; do we need to create a position to do that.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said that the water audit addresses a part of that; we certainly need to find ways to do that.

Councilor Plough reiterated the need to install sidewalks to schools. She is concerned about children when school starts again.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said we are looking for enhancement money from the COG and surplus funds in the Public Works budget. She asked Robert Anderson, Public Works Director to come back with the priority items per district to see what we can accomplish after we look at funding. She acknowledged that this is a critical need, but she doesn't anticipate putting a dent in the list.

Councilor Devine recalled that Robert Anderson sent a list identifying the funding available. She noted that staff is meeting with Richland School District One tomorrow to discuss their concerns.

Mr. Robert Anderson, Public Works Director said he sent the list of priority one sidewalks to the City Manager. He explained that Richland One approached the city three (3) months ago; we mapped out their concerns; and we have a follow-up meeting tomorrow morning. He said there are enhancement funds remaining that require a 60/40 match. He said the priority one list includes requests received from residents; it's not driven by staff. He said they will put all of this together.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Newman, Council voted five (5) to two (2) to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2014-056 – To Raise Revenue and Adopt the Budget for the City of Columbia, South Carolina, or the Fiscal Year ending June 30, 2015, as amended. Voting aye were Mr. Baddourah, Mr. Newman, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Voting nay were Mr. Runyan and Ms. Plough.

General Fund

Budget Reductions

Reduction in funding for COLA/Comp & Class	500,000
Public Relations - Eliminate proposed Special Proj. position	60,000
Office of Business Opp. - Façade program (will be funded with CERF funds)	50,000
Budgeted Reserve	141,527
Total Reductions	751,527

Budget Additions

Planning & Development Services - Annexation function/position	50,000
Non-Departmental	
Economic Development	50,000
Senior Resources	35,670
Sustainable Midlands	45,000
COR (GC Chamber of Commerce-young professionals)	50,000
North Columbia Business Assoc.	90,000
Reduced transfer from Hospitality Tax	430,857
Total Additions	751,527

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Newman, Council voted unanimously to approve the budget for General Capital Projects.

General Capital Projects

Budget Reductions

Southeast Park	310,000
----------------	----------------

(Fund Finlay Park engineering design & study with \$310,000 in remaining Hospitality Tax Proceeds in order to reallocate general fund funding as stated below). Southeast Park remains funded at \$492,000)

Budget Additions

Hyatt Park - increase	160,000
Police Patrol Cars - increase	150,000
Total Additions	310,000

Upon a motion made by Ms. Plough and seconded by Mr. Runyan, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2014-064 – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 5, Buildings and Building Regulations, Article III, Building Permits, Sec. 5-204 Fee Schedule (a)(1) and (d)(1) – *The Public Hearing was held on June 10, 2014. – Approved on first reading.*

APPEARANCE OF THE PUBLIC

Mr. Raj Aluri, Executive Director of the Columbia International Festival thanked Council for their support of the Columbia International Festival over the years. He clarified that the total funding being recommended is \$50,000. He asked that Council consider the request for \$75,000.

Mayor Benjamin agreed to consider that with the other Hospitality Tax requests.

Councilor Davis commended Mr. Aluri on his report on the Columbia International Festival; it really capsulized the cultural and economic impact on the City.

Mr. John Whitehead, Executive Director of the Columbia Music Festival said the plaza for the multi-use facility will become a very important public space. He suggested that the management for the plaza should only be under the club during club activities and under the management of the city for anything else.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Runyan, Council voted unanimously to adjourn at 10:02 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by:

Erika D. Moore
City Clerk